

1 ROB BONTA
Attorney General of California
2 KATHLEEN BOERGER
Supervising Deputy Attorney General
3 KETAKEE KANE
Deputy Attorney General
4 KARLI EISENBERG, State Bar No. 281923
Supervising Deputy Attorney General
5 1300 I Street, Suite 125
P.O. Box 944255
6 Sacramento, CA 95814
Telephone: (916) 324-5567
7 E-mail: Karli.Eisenberg@doj.ca.gov
Attorneys for Plaintiff State of California
8

9 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
10 FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
11 OAKLAND DIVISION
12

13 STATE OF CALIFORNIA, *et al.*

14 Plaintiffs,

15 v.

16 XAVIER BECERRA, Secretary of Health and
17 Human Services, *et al.*,

18 Defendants,

19 and,

20 THE LITTLE SISTERS OF THE POOR, ST.
21 MARY'S HOME, *et al.*,

22 Defendant-Intervenors
23 .
24
25
26
27
28

Case No. 4:17-cv-5783-HSG

**STIPULATION OF VOLUNTARY
DISMISSAL OF PLAINTIFF
COMMONWEALTH OF VIRGINIA'S
CLAIMS WITH PREJUDICE**

1 Plaintiffs, Plaintiff-Intervenor State of Oregon,¹ Defendants, and Defendant-Intervenors, by
2 and through their undersigned counsel, respectfully submit this Stipulation of Voluntary Dismissal
3 of Plaintiff Commonwealth of Virginia's Claims with Prejudice, pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil
4 Procedure 41(a)(1)(A)(ii).

5 WHEREAS, Plaintiff State of California filed a Complaint, ECF No. 1, in this action on
6 October 6, 2017, challenging two Interim Final Rules issued by the U.S. Department of Health and
7 Human Services, in conjunction with the U.S. Department of Labor and U.S. Department of the
8 Treasury, that expanded the scope of the religious exemption, and created a new moral exemption,
9 to the contraceptive mandate of the Patient Protection and Affordable Care Act;

10 WHEREAS, the Commonwealth of Virginia, along with the State of Delaware, the State of
11 Maryland, and the State of New York, joined the State of California in a First Amended Complaint
12 against the Secretary of the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services, the U.S. Department of
13 Health and Human Services, the Secretary of the U.S. Department of Labor, the U.S. Department
14 of Labor, the Secretary of the U.S. Department of the Treasury, and the U.S. Department of the
15 Treasury (collectively, "Defendants"), filed on November 1, 2017, see ECF No. 24;

16 WHEREAS, the Little Sisters of the Poor, St. Mary's Home and the March for Life
17 Education and Defense Fund (collectively, "Defendant-Intervenors") were permitted by this Court
18 to intervene in the lawsuit. See ECF Nos. 486, 134;

19 WHEREAS, the operative complaint in this matter, ECF No. 170, was filed on December
20 18, 2018 by the State of California, the State of Connecticut, the State of Delaware, the District of
21 Columbia, the State of Hawaii, the State of Illinois, the State of Maryland, the State of Minnesota
22 by and through its Department of Human Services, the State of New York, the State of North
23 Carolina, the State of Rhode Island, the State of Vermont, the Commonwealth of Virginia, and the
24 State of Washington (collectively, "Plaintiffs");

25 WHEREAS, Plaintiffs filed a motion for summary judgment on April 30, 2019, ECF No.
26 311;

27 ¹ This Court permitted the State of Oregon to intervene in the lawsuit on February 1, 2019.
28 See ECF No. 274.

1 WHEREAS, Defendants requested and this Court granted a stay in this case, see ECF Nos.
2 462, 467, while the defendant agencies evaluated the issues presented by this litigation, as well as
3 their regulatory and policy options;

4 WHEREAS, the Commonwealth of Virginia wishes to voluntarily dismiss its claims and
5 remove itself from this case;

6 THEREFORE, pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 41(a)(1)(A)(ii), the parties, by
7 and through their undersigned counsel, hereby jointly stipulate and agree that the claims brought
8 by the Commonwealth of Virginia in this lawsuit shall be, and are hereby, dismissed with prejudice,
9 subject to the following conditions:

- 10 1. This stipulation does not affect the claims asserted by any other Plaintiff or Plaintiff-
11 Intervenor besides the Commonwealth of Virginia.
 - 12 2. The parties agree that each side will bear its own fees and costs as they relate to the
13 Commonwealth of Virginia's claims.
- 14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

1 Dated: April 13, 2023

Respectfully submitted,

2 ROB BONTA
3 Attorney General of California
4 KATHLEEN BOERGERS
5 Supervising Deputy Attorney General
6 KETAKEE KANE
7 Deputy Attorney General

8 /s/ Karli Eisenberg
9 KARLI EISENBERG
10 Supervising Deputy Attorney General
11 *Attorneys for Plaintiff the State of California*

12 WILLIAM TONG
13 Attorney General of Connecticut
14 MAURA MURPHY OSBORNE
15 Assistant Attorney General
16 *Attorneys for Plaintiff the State of Connecticut*

17 KATHLEEN JENNINGS
18 Attorney General of Delaware
19 CHRISTIAN DOUGLAS WRIGHT
20 Director of Impact Litigation
21 JESSICA M. WILEY
22 Deputy Attorney General
23 *Attorneys for Plaintiff the State of Delaware*

24 BRIAN SCHWALB
25 Attorney General of the District of Columbia
26 KATHLEEN KONOPKA
27 Deputy Attorney General, Public Advocacy
28 Division
Attorneys for Plaintiff the District of Columbia

LOIO KUHINA
Attorney General of Hawaii
ERIN N. LAU
Deputy Attorney General
Attorneys for Plaintiff the State of Hawaii

KWAME RAOUL
Attorney General of Illinois
HARPREET K. KHERA
Deputy Bureau Chief, Special Litigation Bureau
ELIZABETH MORRIS
Assistant Attorney General, Special Litigation
Bureau
Attorneys for Plaintiff the State of Illinois

1
2 ANTHONY G. BROWN
Attorney General of Maryland
3 CAROLYN A. QUATTROCKI
Deputy Attorney General
4 STEVE M. SULLIVAN
Solicitor General
5 KIMBERLY S. CAMMARATA
Director, Health Education and Advocacy
6 *Attorneys for Plaintiff the State of Maryland*

7
8 KEITH ELLISON
Attorney General of Minnesota
9 JACOB CAMPION
Assistant Attorney General
10 *Attorney for Plaintiff the State of Minnesota,*
by and through its Department of Human Services

11 LETITIA JAMES
Attorney General of New York
12 LISA LANDAU
Bureau Chief, Health Care Bureau
13 STEVEN C. WU
Deputy Solicitor General
14 *Attorneys for Plaintiff the State of New York*

15
16 JOSHUA H. STEIN
Attorney General of North Carolina
17 SRIPRIYA NARASIMHAN
Deputy General Counsel
18 *Attorneys for Plaintiff the State of North Carolina*

19 PETER F. NERONHA
Attorney General of Rhode Island
20 MICHAEL W. FIELD
Assistant Attorney General
21 *Attorneys for Plaintiff the State of Rhode Island*

22 CHARITY R. CLARK
Attorney General of Vermont
23 ELEANOR SPOTTSWOOD
Assistant Attorney General
24 *Attorneys for Plaintiff the State of Vermont*

25 ROBERT F. FERGUSON
Attorney General of Washington
26 *Attorney for Plaintiff the State of Washington*

1
2 Dated: April 13, 2023

Respectfully submitted,

3 JASON S. MIYARES
4 Attorney General of Virginia

5 /s/ Andrew Ferguson
6 ANDREW N. FERGUSON - *pro hac vice*
7 Solicitor General
8 202 North 9th Street
9 Richmond, VA 23219
Telephone: (804) 786-7704
E-mail: a Ferguson@oag.state.va.us
Attorneys for the Commonwealth of Virginia

10 Dated: April 13, 2023

Respectfully submitted,

11 ELLEN F. ROSENBLUM
12 Attorney General of Oregon

13 /s/ J. Nicole DeFever
14 J. NICOLE DEFEVER
15 CA Bar No. 191525
16 Senior Assistant Attorney General
17 *Attorneys for Plaintiff-Intervenor State of Oregon*
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

1
2 Dated: April 13, 2023

Respectfully submitted,

3 BRIAN NETTER
4 Deputy Assistant Attorney General
5 STEPHANIE HINDS
6 United States Attorney
MICHELLE R. BENNETT
Assistant Branch Director

7 /s/ Michael J. Gerardi
8 MICHAEL J. GERARDI
9 DC Bar No. 1017949
10 CHRISTOPHER R. HEALY
11 REBECCA M. KOPPLIN
12 DANIEL RIESS
13 Trial Attorneys
14 United States Department of Justice
15 Civil Division
16 Federal Programs Branch
17 1100 L Street NW
18 Washington, D.C. 20001
19 Telephone: (202) 616-0680
20 E-mail: michael.j.gerardi@usdoj.gov
21 *Counsel for Federal Defendants*
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

1 Dated: April 13, 2023

Respectfully submitted,

2 /s/ Mark Rienzi

3 ERIC C. RASSBACH – No. 288041

4 MARK L. RIENZI – *pro hac vice*

5 LORI H. WINDHAM – *pro hac vice*

6 DIANA VERM THOMSON – *pro hac vice*

7 ADELE AUXIER KEIM – *pro hac vice*

8 DANIEL L. CHEN – No. 312576

9 The Becket Fund for Religious Liberty

10 1919 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Suite 400

11 Washington, DC 20036

12 Telephone: (202) 955-0095

13 Facsimile: (202) 955-0090

14 E-mail: erassbach@becketlaw.org

15 *Counsel for Defendant-Intervenor The Little Sisters*
16 *of the Poor*

11 Dated: April 13, 2023

Respectfully submitted,

12 /s/ Kenneth Connelly

13 KENNETH J. CONNELLY, AZ Bar. No. 25420

14 Alliance Defending Freedom

15 15100 N. 90th Street

16 Scottsdale, AZ 85260

17 Telephone: (480) 444-0020

18 Facsimile: (480) 444-0028

19 E-mail: kconnelly@ADFlegal.org

20 *Counsel for Defendant-Intervenor March for Life*
21 *Education and Defense Fund*

ATTESTATION OF SIGNATURES

I, Karli Eisenberg, hereby attest, pursuant to Local Civil Rule 5-1(h)(3) of the Northern District of California that concurrence in the filing of this document has been obtained from each signatory hereto.

/s/ Karli Eisenberg

Karli Eisenberg
Supervising Deputy Attorney General
Attorney for Plaintiff
State of California

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

Case Name: **State of California v. Health
and Human Services, et al.**

No. **4:17-cv-05783-HSG**

I hereby certify that on April 13, 2023, I electronically filed the following documents with the Clerk of the Court by using the CM/ECF system:

**STIPULATION OF VOLUNTARY DISMISSAL OF PLAINTIFF COMMONWEALTH
OF VIRGINIA'S CLAIMS WITH PREJUDICE**

I certify that **all** participants in the case are registered CM/ECF users and that service will be accomplished by the CM/ECF system.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California and the United States of America the foregoing is true and correct and that this declaration was executed on April 14, 2023, at Sacramento, California.

T. Oakes

Declarant

/s/ T. Oakes

Signature