

INTAPPEAL

**United States District Court
District of Puerto Rico (San Juan)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 3:24-cv-01512-CVR**

Chavez–Demerer v. Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC. et al Date Filed: 11/05/2024
Assigned to: Judge Camille L. Velez–Rive Jury Demand: None
Demand: \$9,999,000 Nature of Suit: 791 Labor: E.R.I.S.A.
Cause: 29:1001 E.R.I.S.A.: Employee Retirement Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Plaintiff

Lori Chavez–Deremer
*Acting Secretary of Labor U.S.
Department of Labor*

represented by **Blair Lane Byrum**
US Department of Labor
Office of the Solicitor, Plan Benefits
Security Division
200 Constitution Avenue NW
Ste N–4611
Washington, DC 20210
202–693–5595
Email: byrum.blair.l@dol.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jamie Leigh Bowers
Department of Labor
Plan Benefits Security
200 Constitution Ave., NW
Room N–4611
Washington, DC 20210
202–693–5628
Fax: 202–693–5610
Email: troutman.jamie.l@dol.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sarah D. Holz
US Department of Labor
Office of the Solicitor
200 Constitution Ave. NW
Room N–4611
Washington, DC 20210
202–693–0194
Fax: 202–693–5610
Email: holz.sarah.d@dol.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katrina T. Liu
United States Department of Labor
Office of the Solicitor
200 Constitution Ave., NW
Room N–4611

Washington, DC 20210
202-693-5520
Fax: 202-693-5610
Email: liu.katrina.t@dol.gov
TERMINATED: 07/26/2025
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC.

represented by **Alberto Jose Bayouth-Montes**
O'Neill & Borges LLC
250 Ave. Muoz Rivera, Suite 800
San Juan, PR 00918-1813
787-764-8181
Fax: 787-753-8944
Email: alberto.bayouth@oneillborges.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Antonio L. Roig-Lorenzo
O'Neill & Borges
250 Munoz Rivera Ave.
Suite 800
San Juan, PR 00918-1813
787-282-5727
Fax: 787-753-8944
Email: roig@oneillborges.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Edward P. Perrin , Jr
Hallett & Perrin PC
1445 Ross Ave.
Suite 2400
Dallas, TX 75202
214-953-0053
Fax: 214-922-4142
Email: eperrin@hallettperrin.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

James N Henry , Jr
Hallett & Perrin, P.C.
1445 Ross Avenue
Suite 2400
Dallas, TX 75202
214-953-0053
Fax: 214-922-4142
Email: jhenry@hallettperrin.com
PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Providence Insurance Company, I.I.

represented by **Alberto Jose Bayouth–Montes**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Antonio L. Roig–Lorenzo
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Edward P. Perrin , Jr
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

James N Henry , Jr
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Alexander Renfro

represented by **Alberto Jose Bayouth–Montes**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Antonio L. Roig–Lorenzo
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

William Bryan

represented by **Alberto Jose Bayouth–Montes**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Antonio L. Roig–Lorenzo
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jonathan Crumly
Freeman Mathis & Gary, LLP
100 Galleria Parkway
Suite 1600
Atlanta, GA 30339
770–818–0000

Fax: 833-330-3669
Email: jonathan.crumly@fmglaw.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Emaan Ali Bangash
Freeman Mathis & Gary LLP
7160 Dallas Parkway
Suite 625
Plano, TX 75024
469-505-0686
Email: emaan.bangash@fmglaw.com
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Robert Glenn Chadwick , Jr
Freeman Mathis & Gary, LLP
7160 Dallas Parkway
Ste #625
Plano, TX 75025
469-895-3003
Email: bob.chadwick@fmglaw.com
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Arjan Zieger

represented by **Alberto Jose Bayouth-Montes**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Antonio L. Roig-Lorenzo
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jonathan Crumly
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Emaan Ali Bangash
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Robert Glenn Chadwick , Jr
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Counter Claimant

Arjan Zieger

represented by **Alberto Jose Bayouth–Montes**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Antonio L. Roig–Lorenzo
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jonathan Crumly
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Robert Glenn Chadwick , Jr
Freeman Mathis & Gary, LLP

7160 Dallas Parkway
Ste #625

Plano, TX 75025
469–895–3003

Fax:
Email: bob.chadwick@fmglaw.com
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Counter Claimant

Alexander Renfro

represented by **Alberto Jose Bayouth–Montes**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Antonio L. Roig–Lorenzo
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Counter Claimant

Providence Insurance Company, I.I.

represented by **Alberto Jose Bayouth–Montes**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Antonio L. Roig–Lorenzo
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Edward P. Perrin , Jr
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

James N Henry , Jr
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Counter Claimant

Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC.

represented by **Alberto Jose Bayouth–Montes**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Antonio L. Roig–Lorenzo
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Edward P. Perrin , Jr
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

James N Henry , Jr
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Counter Claimant

William Bryan

represented by **Alberto Jose Bayouth–Montes**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Antonio L. Roig–Lorenzo
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jonathan Crumly
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Emaan Ali Bangash ,

Freeman Mathis & Gary LLP

7160 Dallas Parkway
Suite 625

Plano, TX 75024
469-505-0686

Fax:

Email: emaan.bangash@fmglaw.com

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Robert Glenn Chadwick , Jr

(See above for address)

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Counter Defendant

Lori Chavez-Deremer

Acting Secretary of Labor U.S.

Department of Labor

represented by **Blair Lane Byrum**

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jamie Leigh Bowers

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sarah D. Holz

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katrina T. Liu

(See above for address)

TERMINATED: 07/26/2025

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Intervenor Defendant

Data Marketing Partnership, LP

TERMINATED: 08/14/2025

represented by **Alberto Jose Bayouth-Montes**

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Intervenor Defendant

LP Management Services, LLC

TERMINATED: 08/14/2025

represented by **Alberto Jose Bayouth-Montes**

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
11/05/2024	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against William Bryan, Providence Insurance Company, I.I., Alexander Renfro, Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC., Arjan Zieger, filed by Julie A. Su. Service due by 2/3/2025, (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Civil Cover Sheet, # <u>2</u> Category Sheet)(Liu, Katrina) Modified on 11/6/2024 to remove fee information since payment is waived for USA (mcm). (Entered: 11/05/2024)
11/05/2024	<u>2</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Jamie Leigh Bowers on behalf of Julie A. Su (Bowers, Jamie) (Entered: 11/05/2024)
11/05/2024	<u>3</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Sarah D. Holz on behalf of Julie A. Su (Holz, Sarah) (Entered: 11/05/2024)
11/06/2024	4	NOTICE OF JUDGE ASSIGNMENT: Case has been assigned to Judge Camille L. Velez-Rive. (vdm) (Entered: 11/06/2024)
12/05/2024	<u>5</u>	WAIVER OF SERVICE Returned Executed by Julie A. Su. Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC. waiver sent on 11/5/2024, answer due 1/6/2025. (Bowers, Jamie) (Entered: 12/05/2024)
12/05/2024	<u>6</u>	WAIVER OF SERVICE Returned Executed by Julie A. Su. Providence Insurance Company, I.I. waiver sent on 11/5/2024, answer due 1/6/2025. (Bowers, Jamie) (Entered: 12/05/2024)
12/05/2024	<u>7</u>	WAIVER OF SERVICE Returned Executed by Julie A. Su. William Bryan waiver sent on 11/5/2024, answer due 1/6/2025. (Bowers, Jamie) (Entered: 12/05/2024)
12/05/2024	<u>8</u>	WAIVER OF SERVICE Returned Executed by Julie A. Su. Alexander Renfro waiver sent on 11/5/2024, answer due 1/6/2025. (Bowers, Jamie) (Entered: 12/05/2024)
12/05/2024	<u>9</u>	WAIVER OF SERVICE Returned Executed by Julie A. Su. Arjan Zieger waiver sent on 11/5/2024, answer due 1/6/2025. (Bowers, Jamie) (Entered: 12/05/2024)
01/02/2025	<u>10</u>	MOTION for extension of time until February 3, 2025 to answer or otherwise respond to the Complaint filed by Antonio L. Roig-Lorenzo on behalf of All Defendants. Responses due by 1/16/2025. NOTE: Pursuant to FRCP 6(a) an additional three days does not apply to service done electronically. (Roig-Lorenzo, Antonio) (Entered: 01/02/2025)
01/02/2025	11	ORDER: granting Docket No. <u>10</u> Motion for extension of time. Defendants shall answer the Complaint or otherwise plead by February 3, 2025. Signed by Judge Camille L. Velez-Rive on January 2, 2025. (ASE) (Entered: 01/02/2025)
01/31/2025	<u>12</u>	Consent MOTION for extension of time until February 17, 2025 to answer or otherwise respond to the Complaint filed by Antonio L. Roig-Lorenzo on behalf of All Defendants. Responses due by 2/14/2025. NOTE: Pursuant to FRCP 6(a) an additional three days does not apply to service done electronically. (Roig-Lorenzo, Antonio) (Entered: 01/31/2025)
01/31/2025	13	ORDER granting <u>12</u> Motion for extension of time. Defendants shall answer the Complaint or otherwise plead by February 17, 2025. Plaintiff is granted until April 18, 2025 to present any response, if necessary. Signed by Judge Camille L. Velez-Rive on 01/31/2025. (CVR) (Entered: 01/31/2025)
02/18/2025	<u>14</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Alberto Jose Bayouth-Montes on behalf of All Defendants (Bayouth-Montes, Alberto) (Entered: 02/18/2025)

02/18/2025	<u>15</u>	***FILED IN ERROR. Missing PHV's handwritten signature*** Motion to allow James N. Henry, Jr. to appear pro hac vice (Pro Hac fee \$300 receipt number APRDC-8993360) filed by Alberto Jose Bayouth-Montes on behalf of Providence Insurance Company, I.I., Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC.. Responses due by 3/4/2025. NOTE: Pursuant to FRCP 6(a) an additional three days does not apply to service done electronically. (Bayouth-Montes, Alberto) Modified on 2/19/2025 (mcm). (Entered: 02/18/2025)
02/18/2025	<u>16</u>	***FILED IN ERROR. Missing PHV's handwritten signature*** Motion to allow Robert G. Chadwick, Jr. to appear pro hac vice (Pro Hac fee \$300 receipt number APRDC-8993377) filed by Alberto Jose Bayouth-Montes on behalf of William Bryan, Arjan Zieger. Responses due by 3/4/2025. NOTE: Pursuant to FRCP 6(a) an additional three days does not apply to service done electronically. (Bayouth-Montes, Alberto) Modified on 2/19/2025 (mcm). (Entered: 02/18/2025)
02/18/2025	<u>17</u>	***FILED IN ERROR. Missing PHV's handwritten signature*** Motion to allow Emaan Ali Bangash to appear pro hac vice (Pro Hac fee \$300 receipt number APRDC-8993406) filed by Alberto Jose Bayouth-Montes on behalf of William Bryan, Arjan Zieger. Responses due by 3/4/2025. NOTE: Pursuant to FRCP 6(a) an additional three days does not apply to service done electronically. (Bayouth-Montes, Alberto) Modified on 2/19/2025 (mcm). (Entered: 02/18/2025)
02/18/2025	<u>18</u>	***FILED IN ERROR. Missing PHV's handwritten signature*** Motion to allow Edward P. Perrin, Jr. to appear pro hac vice (Pro Hac fee \$300 receipt number APRDC-8993432) filed by Alberto Jose Bayouth-Montes on behalf of Providence Insurance Company, I.I., Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC.. Responses due by 3/4/2025. NOTE: Pursuant to FRCP 6(a) an additional three days does not apply to service done electronically. (Bayouth-Montes, Alberto) Modified on 2/19/2025 (mcm). (Entered: 02/18/2025)
02/18/2025	<u>19</u>	***FILED IN ERROR. Missing PHV's handwritten signature*** Motion to allow Jonathan Crumly to appear pro hac vice (Pro Hac fee \$300 receipt number APRDC-8993814) filed by Alberto Jose Bayouth-Montes on behalf of William Bryan, Arjan Zieger. Responses due by 3/4/2025. NOTE: Pursuant to FRCP 6(a) an additional three days does not apply to service done electronically. (Bayouth-Montes, Alberto) Modified on 2/19/2025 (mcm). (Entered: 02/18/2025)
02/18/2025	<u>20</u>	ANSWER to <u>1</u> Complaint, filed by Alberto Jose Bayouth-Montes on behalf of Alexander Renfro.(Bayouth-Montes, Alberto) (Entered: 02/18/2025)
02/18/2025	<u>21</u>	ANSWER to <u>1</u> Complaint, filed by Alberto Jose Bayouth-Montes on behalf of Providence Insurance Company, I.I., Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC..(Bayouth-Montes, Alberto) (Entered: 02/18/2025)
02/18/2025	<u>22</u>	Corporate Disclosure Statement by Providence Insurance Company, I.I.. (Bayouth-Montes, Alberto) (Entered: 02/18/2025)
02/18/2025	<u>23</u>	Corporate Disclosure Statement by Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC.. (Bayouth-Montes, Alberto) (Entered: 02/18/2025)
02/18/2025	<u>24</u>	ANSWER to <u>1</u> Complaint, filed by Alberto Jose Bayouth-Montes on behalf of William Bryan, Arjan Zieger.(Bayouth-Montes, Alberto) (Entered: 02/18/2025)
02/18/2025	<u>25</u>	COUNTERCLAIM against Julie A. Su, filed by Arjan Zieger, Alexander Renfro, Providence Insurance Company, I.I., Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC., William

		Bryan. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F, # <u>7</u> Exhibit G, # <u>8</u> Exhibit H, # <u>9</u> Exhibit I, # <u>10</u> Exhibit J, # <u>11</u> Exhibit K, # <u>12</u> Exhibit L, # <u>13</u> Exhibit M, # <u>14</u> Exhibit N, # <u>15</u> Exhibit O, # <u>16</u> Exhibit P, # <u>17</u> Exhibit Q, # <u>18</u> Exhibit R, # <u>19</u> Exhibit S, # <u>20</u> Exhibit T, # <u>21</u> Exhibit U, # <u>22</u> Exhibit V)(Bayouth–Montes, Alberto) (Entered: 02/18/2025)
02/18/2025	<u>26</u>	MOTION to transfer case filed by Alberto Jose Bayouth–Montes on behalf of William Bryan, Providence Insurance Company, I.I., Alexander Renfro, Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC., Arjan Zieger. Responses due by 2/28/2025. NOTE: Pursuant to FRCP 6(a) an additional three days does not apply to service done electronically. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A)(Bayouth–Montes, Alberto) (Entered: 02/18/2025)
02/18/2025	<u>27</u>	MOTION to Stay <i>and Memorandum in Support</i> re: <u>26</u> MOTION to transfer case filed by Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC., William Bryan, Alexander Renfro, Providence Insurance Company, I.I., Arjan Zieger filed by Alberto Jose Bayouth–Montes on behalf of William Bryan, Providence Insurance Company, I.I., Alexander Renfro, Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC., Arjan Zieger. Responses due by 3/4/2025. NOTE: Pursuant to FRCP 6(a) an additional three days does not apply to service done electronically. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B)(Related document(s) <u>26</u>) (Bayouth–Montes, Alberto) (Entered: 02/18/2025)
02/19/2025		NOTICE of Docket Text Modification by Deputy Clerk re: <u>15</u> Motion to allow James N. Henry, Jr. to appear pro hac vice (Pro Hac fee \$300 receipt number APRDC–8993360), <u>16</u> Motion to allow Robert G. Chadwick, Jr. to appear pro hac vice (Pro Hac fee \$300 receipt number APRDC–8993377), <u>17</u> Motion to allow Emaan Ali Bangash to appear pro hac vice (Pro Hac fee \$300 receipt number APRDC–8993406), <u>18</u> Motion to allow Edward P. Perrin, Jr. to appear pro hac vice (Pro Hac fee \$300 receipt number APRDC–8993432), <u>19</u> Motion to allow Jonathan Crumly to appear pro hac vice (Pro Hac fee \$300 receipt number APRDC–8993814). ***FILED IN ERROR – Incorrect signature format for PHV. Pro Hac Vice shall use handwritten signature when requesting leave to appear. To be re–filed.*** (mcm) (Entered: 02/19/2025)
02/19/2025	<u>28</u>	Motion to allow James N. Henry, Jr. to appear pro hac vice (Pro Hac fee \$300 receipt number APRDC–8993360) filed by Alberto Jose Bayouth–Montes on behalf of Providence Insurance Company, I.I., Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC.. Responses due by 3/5/2025. NOTE: Pursuant to FRCP 6(a) an additional three days does not apply to service done electronically. (Bayouth–Montes, Alberto) (Entered: 02/19/2025)
02/19/2025	29	ORDER granting <u>28</u> Motion to Appear PHV. Signed by Judge Camille L. Velez–Rive on 02/19/2025. (CVR) (Entered: 02/19/2025)
02/19/2025	<u>30</u>	Motion to allow Emaan Ali Bangash to appear pro hac vice (Pro Hac fee \$300 receipt number APRDC–8993406) filed by Alberto Jose Bayouth–Montes on behalf of William Bryan, Arjan Zieger. Responses due by 3/5/2025. NOTE: Pursuant to FRCP 6(a) an additional three days does not apply to service done electronically. (Bayouth–Montes, Alberto) (Entered: 02/19/2025)
02/19/2025	<u>31</u>	Motion to allow Robert G. Chadwick, Jr. to appear pro hac vice (Pro Hac fee \$300 receipt number APRDC–8993377) filed by Alberto Jose Bayouth–Montes on behalf of William Bryan, Arjan Zieger. Responses due by 3/5/2025. NOTE: Pursuant to FRCP 6(a) an additional three days does not apply to service done electronically. (Bayouth–Montes, Alberto) (Entered: 02/19/2025)

02/19/2025	32	ORDER granting <u>30</u> Motion to Appear PHV; granting <u>31</u> Motion to Appear PHV. Signed by Judge Camille L. Velez-Rive on 02/19/2025. (CVR) (Entered: 02/19/2025)
02/19/2025	<u>33</u>	Motion to allow Edward P. Perrin, Jr. to appear pro hac vice (Pro Hac fee \$300 receipt number APRDC-8993432) filed by Alberto Jose Bayouth-Montes on behalf of Providence Insurance Company, I.I., Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC.. Responses due by 3/5/2025. NOTE: Pursuant to FRCP 6(a) an additional three days does not apply to service done electronically. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Bayouth-Montes, Alberto) (Entered: 02/19/2025)
02/19/2025	34	ORDER granting <u>33</u> Motion to Appear PHV. Signed by Judge Camille L. Velez-Rive on 02/19/2025. (CVR) (Entered: 02/19/2025)
02/19/2025	<u>35</u>	Motion to allow Jonathan Crumly to appear pro hac vice (Pro Hac fee \$300 receipt number APRDC-8993814) filed by Alberto Jose Bayouth-Montes on behalf of William Bryan, Arjan Zieger. Responses due by 3/5/2025. NOTE: Pursuant to FRCP 6(a) an additional three days does not apply to service done electronically. (Bayouth-Montes, Alberto) (Entered: 02/19/2025)
02/20/2025	36	ORDER granting <u>35</u> Motion to Appear PHV. Signed by Judge Camille L. Velez-Rive on 02/20/2025. (CVR) (Entered: 02/20/2025)
02/20/2025	37	NOTICE TO PRO HAC VICE James N. Henry, Jr., Emaan Ali Bangash, Robert G. Chadwick, Jr., Edward P. Perrin, Jr. and Jonathan Crumly re: 34 Order on Motion to Appear PHV, 32 Order on Motion to Appear PHV, 36 Order on Motion to Appear PHV, 29 Order on Motion to Appear PHV : The Court has granted your pro hac vice application. In order to start receiving notifications, you must file a notice of appearance using your upgraded PACER account. For more information, visit the following link: https://www.prd.uscourts.gov/nextgen-cmecf-what-it-means-you . (mcm) (Entered: 02/20/2025)
02/20/2025	<u>38</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Emaan Ali Bangash on behalf of William Bryan, Arjan Zieger (Bangash, Emaan) (Entered: 02/20/2025)
02/21/2025	<u>39</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by James N Henry, Jr on behalf of Providence Insurance Company, I.I., Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC. (Henry, James) (Entered: 02/21/2025)
02/21/2025	<u>40</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Robert Glenn Chadwick, Jr on behalf of William Bryan, Arjan Zieger (Chadwick, Robert) (Entered: 02/21/2025)
02/21/2025	<u>41</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Jonathan Crumly on behalf of William Bryan, Arjan Zieger (Crumly, Jonathan) (Entered: 02/21/2025)
02/25/2025	<u>42</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Edward P. Perrin, Jr on behalf of Providence Insurance Company, I.I., Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC. (Perrin, Edward) (Entered: 02/25/2025)
02/25/2025	<u>43</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to <u>25</u> Counterclaim,, filed by Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC., William Bryan, Alexander Renfro, Providence Insurance Company, I.I., Arjan Zieger, <u>27</u> MOTION to Stay <i>and Memorandum in Support</i> re: <u>26</u> MOTION to transfer case filed by Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC., William Bryan, Alexander Renfro, Providence Insurance Company, I.I., Arjan Zieger filed by Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC., William Bryan, Alexander Renfro, Providence Insurance Company, I.I., Arjan Zieger,

		<u>26</u> MOTION to transfer case filed by Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC., William Bryan, Alexander Renfro, Providence Insurance Company, I.I., Arjan Zieger filed by Jamie Leigh Bowers on behalf of Julie A. Su. Responses due by 3/11/2025. NOTE: Pursuant to FRCP 6(a) an additional three days does not apply to service done electronically. (Related document(s) <u>25</u> , <u>27</u> , <u>26</u>) (Bowers, Jamie) (Entered: 02/25/2025)
02/25/2025	<u>44</u>	ORDER granting <u>43</u> Motion for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply. The Acting Secretary of Labor is granted until April 25, 2025 to answer and/or respond to Defendants' Original Counterclaim for Declaratory and Injunctive Relief (ECF No. 25), Defendants' Motion to Transfer Venue and Memorandum in Support (ECF No. 26), and Defendants' Motion to Stay and Memorandum in Support (ECF No. 27). Signed by Judge Camille L. Velez–Rive on 02/25/2025. (CVR) (Entered: 02/25/2025)
02/26/2025	<u>45</u>	NOTICE of Party Substitution by Julie A. Su (Bowers, Jamie) (Entered: 02/26/2025)
03/06/2025	<u>46</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Blair Lane Byrum on behalf of Vincent N. Micone, III (Byrum, Blair) (Entered: 03/06/2025)
03/20/2025	<u>47</u>	NOTICE of Party Substitution by Vincent N. Micone, III (Bowers, Jamie) (Entered: 03/20/2025)
04/25/2025	<u>48</u>	MOTION to Dismiss for Failure to State a Claim filed by Jamie Leigh Bowers on behalf of Lori Chavez–Deremer. Responses due by 5/9/2025. NOTE: Pursuant to FRCP 6(a) an additional three days does not apply to service done electronically. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Memorandum in Support of Motion to Dismiss, # <u>2</u> Exhibit A (DMP Litigation Order from April 8, 2025), # <u>3</u> Exhibit B (Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC v. U.S. Department of Labor Order from March 28, 2022))(Bowers, Jamie) (Entered: 04/25/2025)
04/25/2025	<u>49</u>	MEMORANDUM in Opposition to <i>Defendants' Motion to Transfer Venue and Defendants' Motion to Stay</i> filed by Lori Chavez–Deremer Re: <u>27</u> MOTION to Stay and Memorandum in Support re: <u>26</u> MOTION to transfer case filed by Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC., William Bryan, Alexander Renfro, Providence Insurance Company, I.I., Arjan Zieger filed by Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC., William Bryan, Alexander Renfro, Providence Insurance Company, I.I., Arjan Zieger, <u>26</u> MOTION to transfer case filed by Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC., William Bryan, Alexander Renfro, Providence Insurance Company, I.I., Arjan Zieger filed by Lori Chavez–Deremer. (Bowers, Jamie) (Entered: 04/25/2025)
05/07/2025	<u>50</u>	MOTION for extension of time until 6/9/2025 to respond to the Motion to Dismiss (Docket No. 48), potentially amend its Counterclaim (Docket No. 25), and reply to the Response in Opposition to Defendants Motion to Transfer and Stay (Docket No. 49) filed by Alberto Jose Bayouth–Montes on behalf of William Bryan, Providence Insurance Company, I.I., Alexander Renfro, Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC., Arjan Zieger. Responses due by 5/21/2025. NOTE: Pursuant to FRCP 6(a) an additional three days does not apply to service done electronically. (Bayouth–Montes, Alberto) (Entered: 05/07/2025)
05/07/2025	<u>51</u>	ORDER: granting Docket No. <u>50</u> Motion for extension of time. Defendants are granted until June 9, 2025 to file an Opposition the Motion to Dismiss (Docket No. 48), file an amended Counterclaim, and to file a Reply to the Opposition to the request to transfer and stay (Docket No. 49). Signed by Judge Camille L. Velez–Rive on May 7, 2025. (ASE) (Entered: 05/07/2025)

06/09/2025	<u>52</u>	First AMENDED COUNTERCLAIM <i>FOR DECLARATORY AND INJUNCTIVE RELIEF</i> against Lori Chavez–Deremer, filed by Arjan Zieger, William Bryan, Alexander Renfro, Providence Insurance Company, I.I., Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F, # <u>7</u> Exhibit G, # <u>8</u> Exhibit H, # <u>9</u> Exhibit I, # <u>10</u> Exhibit J, # <u>11</u> Exhibit K, # <u>12</u> Exhibit L, # <u>13</u> Exhibit M, # <u>14</u> Exhibit N, # <u>15</u> Exhibit O, # <u>16</u> Exhibit P, # <u>17</u> Exhibit Q, # <u>18</u> Exhibit R, # <u>19</u> Exhibit S, # <u>20</u> Exhibit T, # <u>21</u> Exhibit U, # <u>22</u> Exhibit V)(Bayouth–Montes, Alberto) (Entered: 06/09/2025)
06/09/2025	<u>53</u>	MOTION to Intervene filed by Alberto Jose Bayouth–Montes on behalf of Data Marketing Partnership, LP, LP Management Services, LLC. Responses due by 6/23/2025. NOTE: Pursuant to FRCP 6(a) an additional three days does not apply to service done electronically. (Bayouth–Montes, Alberto) (Entered: 06/09/2025)
06/09/2025	<u>54</u>	MEMORANDUM in Support of <i>Motion to Intervene</i> filed by Data Marketing Partnership, LP, LP Management Services, LLC Re: <u>53</u> MOTION to Intervene filed by LP Management Services, LLC, Data Marketing Partnership, LP filed by Data Marketing Partnership, LP, LP Management Services, LLC. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Complaint in Intervention, # <u>2</u> Exhibit A, # <u>3</u> Exhibit B, # <u>4</u> Exhibit C, # <u>5</u> Exhibit D, # <u>6</u> Exhibit E, # <u>7</u> Exhibit F, # <u>8</u> Exhibit G, # <u>9</u> Exhibit H, # <u>10</u> Exhibit I, # <u>11</u> Exhibit J, # <u>12</u> Exhibit K, # <u>13</u> Exhibit L, # <u>14</u> Exhibit M, # <u>15</u> Exhibit N, # <u>16</u> Exhibit O, # <u>17</u> Exhibit P, # <u>18</u> Exhibit Q)(Bayouth–Montes, Alberto) (Entered: 06/09/2025)
06/10/2025	<u>55</u>	ORDER: Denying Docket No. <u>26</u> Motion to transfer case; and denying as moot Docket No. <u>27</u> Motion to Stay. Signed by Judge Camille L. Velez–Rive on June 10, 2025. (ASE) (Entered: 06/10/2025)
06/10/2025	56	ORDER: denying without prejudice Docket No. <u>48</u> Motion to Dismiss for Failure to State a Claim, in light of the filing at Docket No. 52. The Secretary of Labor is granted until June 30, 2025 to answer or otherwise plead as to the First Amended Counterclaim (Docket No. 52). Signed by Judge Camille L. Velez–Rive on June 10, 2025. (ASE) (Entered: 06/10/2025)
06/18/2025	<u>57</u>	Consent MOTION for extension of time until 08/08/2025 to Answer or Otherwise Plead in Response to Defendants' First Amended Counterclaim (ECF No. 52) and Respond to the Motion to Intervene (ECF No. 53) filed by Sarah D. Holz on behalf of Lori Chavez–Deremer. Responses due by 7/2/2025. NOTE: Pursuant to FRCP 6(a) an additional three days does not apply to service done electronically. (Holz, Sarah) (Entered: 06/18/2025)
06/18/2025	58	ORDER granting <u>57</u> Motion for extension of time. The Secretary of Labor is granted until August 8, 2025, to answer and/or respond to Defendants First Amended Counterclaim for Declaratory and Injunctive Relief (ECF No. 52) and the Motion to Intervene filed by DMP and LPMS (ECF No. 53). Signed by Judge Camille L. Velez–Rive on 06/18/2025. (CVR) (Entered: 06/18/2025)
07/25/2025	<u>59</u>	NOTICE of <i>Withdrawal of Counsel</i> by Lori Chavez–Deremer (Liu, Katrina) (Entered: 07/25/2025)
08/08/2025	<u>60</u>	MOTION to Dismiss for Failure to State a Claim (<i>Defendants' First Amended Counterclaim for Declaratory and Injunctive Relief</i>) filed by Jamie Leigh Bowers on behalf of Lori Chavez–Deremer. Responses due by 8/22/2025. NOTE: Pursuant to FRCP 6(a) an additional three days does not apply to service done electronically. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Memorandum in Support of Secretary's Motion to Dismiss

		Defendants' First Amended Counterclaim for Declaratory and Injunctive Relief, # <u>2</u> Exhibit A, # <u>3</u> Exhibit B, # <u>4</u> Exhibit C, # <u>5</u> Exhibit D)(Bowers, Jamie) (Entered: 08/08/2025)
08/08/2025	<u>61</u>	***FILED IN ERROR. Counsel filed using another counsel's login/password. To be re-filed.*** MEMORANDUM in Opposition filed by Lori Chavez-Deremer Re: <u>53</u> MOTION to Intervene filed by LP Management Services, LLC, Data Marketing Partnership, LP filed by Lori Chavez-Deremer. (Bowers, Jamie) Modified on 8/11/2025 (mcm). (Entered: 08/08/2025)
08/11/2025	<u>62</u>	MEMORANDUM in Opposition filed by Lori Chavez-Deremer Re: <u>53</u> MOTION to Intervene filed by LP Management Services, LLC, Data Marketing Partnership, LP filed by Lori Chavez-Deremer. (Byrum, Blair) (Entered: 08/11/2025)
08/14/2025	63	ORDER: denying Docket No. <u>53</u> Motion to Intervene. Data Marketing Partnership, LP and LP Management Services, LLC request intervention in this case alleging financial interests in the outcome of this litigation. As well explained by the Secretary in her opposition, these parties already have a case that has been ongoing for 5 years before the District Court for the Northern District of Texas against her regarding an advisory opinion as to whether certain plans were covered under the Employee Retirement Income Security Act (ERISA). (Docket No. 62). The claims they want to bring before this Court are directly related to the Texas case and not to the ones before this Court, where the Secretary alleges violations to fiduciary duties of ERISA plans by different plaintiffs. This Court has already ruled that besides the Secretary, the cases involve different parties, wholly different claims, and harms. (Docket No. 55). Thus, they are not the type of actions that would merit a finding in favor of intervention. In addition, the Court bases its ruling on the other grounds raised by the Secretary in her opposition to the motion to intervene, which are found to be persuasive. Signed by Judge Camille L. Velez-Rive on August 14, 2025. (ASE) (Entered: 08/14/2025)
08/15/2025	<u>64</u>	MOTION for extension of time until 9/22/2025 to to respond to the Motion to Dismiss at Docket Entry 60 filed by Alberto Jose Bayouth-Montes on behalf of William Bryan, Providence Insurance Company, I.I., Alexander Renfro, Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC., Arjan Zieger. Responses due by 8/29/2025. NOTE: Pursuant to FRCP 6(a) an additional three days does not apply to service done electronically. (Bayouth-Montes, Alberto) (Entered: 08/15/2025)
08/15/2025	65	ORDER granting as unopposed <u>64</u> Motion for extension of time. Defendants-Counterclaim Plaintiffs are granted until 9/22/2025 to respond to the Motion to Dismiss (ECF No. 60). Signed by Judge Camille L. Velez-Rive on 08/15/2025. (CVR) (Entered: 08/15/2025)
09/12/2025	<u>66</u>	NOTICE OF INTERLOCUTORY APPEAL as to 63 Order on Motion to Intervene,,,,, by Data Marketing Partnership, LP, LP Management Services, LLC. Filing fee \$605, receipt number APRDC-9243078. NOTICE TO COUNSEL: Counsel should register for a First Circuit CM/ECF Appellate Filer Account at http://pacer.psc.uscourts.gov/cmecf/. Counsel should also review the First Circuit requirements for electronic filing by visiting the CM/ECF Information section at http://www.ca1.uscourts.gov/cmecf (Bayouth-Montes, Alberto) Modified on 9/15/2025 to update event title (mcm). (Entered: 09/12/2025)
09/12/2025		

		***SEE IMAGE AT DOCKET <u>66</u> *** NOTICE OF INTERLOCUTORY APPEAL as to 63 Order on Motion to Intervene, by Data Marketing Partnership, LP, LP Management Services, LLC. (Filing fee \$ 605, receipt number APRDC-9243078) (mcm) (Entered: 09/15/2025)
09/15/2025	<u>67</u>	MOTION to Stay <i>Pending Appeal</i> re: Notice of Interlocutory Appeal filed by LP Management Services, LLC, Data Marketing Partnership, LP, <u>66</u> Notice of Appeal,, filed by LP Management Services, LLC, Data Marketing Partnership, LP filed by Alberto Jose Bayouth-Montes on behalf of Data Marketing Partnership, LP, LP Management Services, LLC. Responses due by 9/29/2025. NOTE: Pursuant to FRCP 6(a) an additional three days does not apply to service done electronically. (Related document(s)[], <u>66</u>) (Bayouth-Montes, Alberto) (Entered: 09/15/2025)
09/15/2025	<u>68</u>	MEMORANDUM in Support of <i>Motion to Stay</i> filed by Data Marketing Partnership, LP, LP Management Services, LLC Re: <u>67</u> MOTION to Stay <i>Pending Appeal</i> re: Notice of Interlocutory Appeal filed by LP Management Services, LLC, Data Marketing Partnership, LP, <u>66</u> Notice of Appeal,, filed by LP Management Services, LLC, Data Marketing Partnership, LP filed by LP Management Services, LLC, Data Marketing Partnership, LP filed by Data Marketing Partnership, LP, LP Management Services, LLC. (Bayouth-Montes, Alberto) (Entered: 09/15/2025)
09/17/2025	<u>69</u>	Certified and Transmitted Record on Appeal to US Court of Appeals re <u>66</u> Notice of Interlocutory Appeal [Docket Entries 63 & 66] (idg) (Entered: 09/17/2025)

MIME-Version:1.0

From:prd_docketing@prd.uscourts.gov

To:prd_docketing@prd.uscourts.gov

Bcc:

--Case Participants: James N Henry, Jr (bcardenas@hallettperrin.com, jhenry@hallettperrin.com), Jamie Leigh Bowers (troutman.jamie.l@dol.gov), Blair Lane Byrum (byrum.blair.l@dol.gov), Antonio L. Roig-Lorenzo (antonio.roig@oneillborges.com, docket_clerk@oneillborges.com, ivette.morales@oneillborges.com, roig@oneillborges.com), Jonathan Crumly (dmiller@taylorenghish.com, jonathan.crumly@fmglaw.com, tmckemie@taylorenghish.com), Emaan Ali Bangash (emaan.bangash@fmglaw.com), Edward P. Perrin, Jr (awilson@hallettperrin.com, eperrin@hallettperrin.com), Sarah D. Holz (holz.sarah.d@dol.gov), Robert Glenn Chadwick, Jr (bob.chadwick@fmglaw.com), Alberto Jose Bayouth-Montes (alberto.bayouth@gmail.com, alberto.bayouth@oneillborges.com, docket_clerk@oneillborges.com, yadira.capo@oneillborges.com), Judge Camille L. Velez-Rive (prd_cvr@prd.uscourts.gov)

--Non Case Participants:

--No Notice Sent:

Message-Id:8882382@prd.uscourts.gov

Subject:Activity in Case 3:24-cv-01512-CVR Chavez-Demerer v. Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC. et al Order on Motion to Intervene

Content-Type: text/html

United States District Court

District of Puerto Rico

Notice of Electronic Filing

The following transaction was entered on 8/14/2025 at 11:18 AM AST and filed on 8/14/2025

Case Name: Chavez-Demerer v. Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC. et al

Case Number: 3:24-cv-01512-CVR

Filer:

Document Number: 63(No document attached)

Docket Text:

ORDER: denying Docket No. [53] Motion to Intervene. Data Marketing Partnership, LP and LP Management Services, LLC request intervention in this case alleging financial interests in the outcome of this litigation. As well explained by the Secretary in her opposition, these parties already have a case that has been ongoing for 5 years before the District Court for the Northern District of Texas against her regarding an advisory opinion as to whether certain plans were covered under the Employee Retirement Income Security Act (ERISA). (Docket No. 62). The claims they want to bring before this Court are directly related to the Texas case and not to the ones before this Court, where the Secretary alleges violations to fiduciary duties of ERISA plans by different plaintiffs. This Court has already ruled that besides the Secretary, the cases involve different parties, wholly different claims, and harms. (Docket No. 55). Thus, they are not the type of actions that would merit a finding in favor of intervention. In addition, the Court bases its ruling on the other grounds raised by the Secretary in her opposition to the motion to intervene, which are found to be persuasive. Signed by Judge Camille L. Velez-Rive on August 14, 2025. (ASE)

3:24-cv-01512-CVR Notice has been electronically mailed to:

Antonio L. Roig–Lorenzo roig@oneillborges.com, Docket_Clerk@oneillborges.com,
antonio.roig@oneillborges.com, ivette.morales@oneillborges.com

Alberto Jose Bayouth–Montes alberto.bayouth@oneillborges.com, alberto.bayouth@gmail.com,
docket_clerk@oneillborges.com, yadira.capo@oneillborges.com

Jonathan Crumly jonathan.crumly@fmglaw.com, dmiller@taylorenghish.com,
tmckemie@taylorenghish.com

Jamie Leigh Bowers troutman.jamie.l@dol.gov

Sarah D. Holz holz.sarah.d@dol.gov

Emaan Ali Bangash emaan.bangash@fmglaw.com

James N Henry, Jr jhenry@hallettperrin.com, bcardenas@hallettperrin.com

Robert Glenn Chadwick, Jr bob.chadwick@fmglaw.com

Edward P. Perrin, Jr eperrin@hallettperrin.com, awilson@hallettperrin.com

Blair Lane Byrum byrum.blair.l@dol.gov

3:24–cv–01512–CVR Notice has been delivered by other means to:

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF PUERTO RICO**

LORI CHAVEZ-DEREMER, ACTING
SECRETARY OF LABOR, UNITED
STATES DEPARTMENT OF LABOR,

Plaintiff,

v.

SUFFOLK ADMINISTRATIVE
SERVICES, LLC; PROVIDENCE
INSURANCE CO, I.I.; ALEXANDER
RENFRO; WILLIAM BRYAN; ARJAN
ZIEGER,

Defendants-Counterclaim Plaintiffs.

Civil No.: 3:24-cv-01512 (CVR)

NOTICE OF APPEAL

TO THE HONORABLE COURT:

Notice is hereby given that Data Marketing Partnership, LP and LP Management Services, LLC, Intervening Defendants in the above-named matter, hereby appeal to the United States Court of Appeals for the First Circuit from the Order Denying Intervenors’ Motion to Intervene entered in this action on August 14, 2025, at Docket Number 63.

WE HEREBY CERTIFY that on this date, we electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system, which will send notification of such filing to all attorneys of record.

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED,

In San Juan, Puerto Rico this 12th day of September, 2025

FREEMAN MATHIS & GARY, LLP

/s/ Jonathan Crumly _____

Jonathan Crumly (*Pro Hac Vice*)
Georgia Bar No. 199466
Jonathan.Crumly@fmglaw.com
100 Galleria Parkway, Suite 1600
Atlanta, Georgia 30339-5948
Tel: 770.818.0000
Fax: 770.937.9960

Robert G. Chadwick, Jr. (*Pro Hac Vice*)
Texas Bar No. 04056075
Bob.Chadwick@fmglaw.com
Emaan Ali Bangash (*Pro Hac Vice*)
Texas Bar No. 24142655
Emaan.bangash@fmglaw.com
7160 Dallas Parkway, Suite 625
Plano, Texas 75024
Tel: 469.895.3003
Fax: 888.356.3602

Attorneys for Intervenors

O'NEILL & BORGES, LLC

/s/ Antonio L. Roig-Lorenzo _____

Antonio L. Roig-Lorenzo
USDC No. 207712
antonio.roig@oneillborges.com
250 Muñoz Rivera Ave., Ste. 800
San Juan, PR 00918-1813
Telephone: 787-764-8181
Fax: 787-753-8944

/s/ Alberto J. Bayouth-Montes _____

Alberto J. Bayouth-Montes
USDC No. 228313
alberto.bayouth@oneillborges.com
250 Muñoz Rivera Ave., Ste. 800
San Juan, PR 00918-1813
Telephone: 787-764-8181
Fax: 787-753-8944

Local Counsel for Intervenors

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF PUERTO RICO**
Transmittal of Abbreviated Record to the Court of Appeals

DATE: September 17, 2025

DC #: 24-1512 (CVR) / NOTICE OF INTERLOCUTORY APPEAL

APPEAL FEE PAID: YES X NO

CASE CAPTION: Chávez-Demerer v. Suffolk Administrative Services, LLC et al

IN FORMA PAUPERIS: YES NO X

MOTIONS PENDING: YES X NO

NOTICE OF APPEAL FILED BY: Defendants

APPEAL FROM: Order entered on 08/14/2025

SPECIAL COMMENTS: Electronically filed documents

INDEX OF DOCUMENTS INCLUDED AS THE RECORD ON APPEAL:

DOCUMENTS:

Docket Entries 63 & 66

I HEREBY CERTIFY that the enclosed documents contained herein are the pleadings as described above and constitute the abbreviated record on appeal in the case.

ADA I. GARCIA-RIVERA, ESQ.
Clerk of the Court

S/ Idnar Díaz
Idnar Díaz
Deputy Clerk

s/c: CM/ECF Parties, Appeals Clerk

United States Court of Appeals For the First Circuit

No. 25-1886

VINCENT N. MICONE, III, Acting Secretary of Labor, US Department of Labor,

Plaintiff - Appellee,

v.

SUFFOLK ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES, LLC.; PROVIDENCE INSURANCE CO., I.I.;
ALEXANDER RENFRO; WILLIAM BRYAN; ARJAN ZIEGER,

Defendants - Appellees,

DATA MARKETING PARTNERSHIP, LP; LP MANAGEMENT SERVICES, LLC,

Interested Parties - Appellants.

CASE OPENING NOTICE

Issued: September 19, 2025

The above-captioned appeal was docketed in this court today pursuant to Rule 12 of the Federal Rules of Appellate Procedure. The above case number and caption (unless modified or amended as reflected in the heading of future court notices or orders) should be used on all papers subsequently submitted to this court. If any party disagrees with the clerk's office's designation of the parties on appeal, it must file a motion to amend the caption with any supporting documentation attached. Absent an order granting such a motion, the parties are directed to use the above caption on all pleadings related to this case.

Appellant must complete and return the following forms to the clerk's office by **October 3, 2025** to be deemed timely filed:

- [Appearance Form](#)
- [Docketing Statement](#)

These forms are available on the court's website at www.ca1.uscourts.gov, under "Forms & Notices." Failure to comply with the deadlines set by the court may result in dismissal of the appeal for lack of diligent prosecution. See 1st Cir. R. 3.0, 10.0, and 45.0.

Upon confirmation by the circuit clerk that the record is complete either because no hearing was held, no transcript is necessary, or the transcript is on file, the clerk's office will set the briefing schedule and forward a scheduling notice to the parties.

Unless the appellant was already determined to be in forma pauperis in the underlying district court action, or was determined to be financially unable to obtain an adequate defense in a criminal case, see Fed. R. App. P. 24(a)(3), a filing fee is due within seven days of filing the notice of appeal. An appellant not already determined to be indigent, who seeks to appeal in forma pauperis, must file a motion and financial affidavit in the district court in compliance with Fed. R. App. P. 24. For an appellant not already determined to be indigent, failure to pay the filing fee or file a motion seeking in forma pauperis status with the district court within fourteen days of the date of this notice, may result in the appeal being dismissed for lack of prosecution. 1st Cir. R. 3.0(b).

An appearance form should be completed and returned immediately by any attorney who wishes to file pleadings in this court. 1st Cir. R. 12.0(a) and 46.0(a)(2). Any attorney who has not been admitted to practice before the First Circuit Court of Appeals must submit an application and fee for admission using the court's Case Management/Electronic Case Files ("CM/ECF") system prior to filing an appearance form. 1st Cir. R. 46.0(a). *Pro se* parties are not required to file an appearance form.

Dockets, opinions, rules, forms, attorney admission applications, the court calendar and general notices can be obtained from the court's website at www.ca1.uscourts.gov. Your attention is called specifically to the notice(s) listed below:

- [Notice to Counsel and Pro Se Litigants](#)
- [Transcript Notice](#)

If you wish to inquire about your case by telephone, please contact the case manager at the direct extension listed below.

Anastasia Dubrovsky, Clerk

UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS
FOR THE FIRST CIRCUIT
John Joseph Moakley
United States Courthouse
1 Courthouse Way, Suite 2500
Boston, MA 02210
Case Manager: Gloria - (617) 748-4214

United States Court of Appeals For the First Circuit

NOTICE OF ELECTRONIC AVAILABILITY OF CASE INFORMATION

The First Circuit has implemented the Federal Judiciary's Case Management/Electronic Case Files System ("CM/ECF") which permits documents to be filed electronically. In addition, most documents filed in paper are scanned and attached to the docket. In social security and immigration cases, members of the general public have remote electronic access through PACER only to opinions, orders, judgments or other dispositions of the court. Otherwise, public filings on the court's docket are remotely available to the general public through PACER. Accordingly, parties should not include in their public filings (including attachments or appendices) information that is too private or sensitive to be posted on the internet.

Specifically, Fed. R. App. P. 25(a)(5), Fed. R. Bank. P. 9037, Fed. R. Civ. P. 5.2 and Fed. R. Cr. P. 49.1 require that parties not include, or partially redact where inclusion is necessary, the following personal data identifiers from documents filed with the court unless an exemption applies:

- **Social Security or Taxpayer Identification Numbers.** If an individual's social security or taxpayer identification number must be included, only the last four digits of that number should be used.
- **Names of Minor Children.** If the involvement of a minor child must be mentioned, only the initials of that child should be used.
- **Dates of Birth.** If an individual's date of birth must be included, only the year should be used.
- **Financial Account Numbers.** If financial account numbers are relevant, only the last four digits of these numbers should be used.
- **Home Addresses in Criminal Cases.** If a home address must be included, only the city and state should be listed.

See also 1st Cir. R. 25.0(m).

If the caption of the case contains any of the personal data identifiers listed above, the parties should file a motion to amend caption to redact the identifier.

Parties should exercise caution in including other sensitive personal data in their filings, such as personal identifying numbers, medical records, employment history, individual financial information, proprietary or trade secret information, information regarding an individual's cooperation with the government, information regarding the victim of any criminal activity, national security information, and sensitive security information as described in 49 U.S.C. § 114.

Attorneys are urged to share this notice with their clients so that an informed decision can be made about inclusion of sensitive information. The clerk will not review filings for redaction. Filers are advised that it is the experience of this court that failure to comply with redaction requirements is most apt to occur in attachments, addenda, or appendices, and, thus, special attention should be given to them. For further information, including a list of exemptions from the redaction requirement, see <http://www.privacy.uscourts.gov/>.

United States Court of Appeals For the First Circuit

NOTICE TO COUNSEL REGARDING MANDATORY REGISTRATION AND TRAINING FOR ELECTRONIC FILING (CM/ECF)

On August 21, 2017, the U.S. Court of Appeals for the First Circuit upgraded its CM/ECF system to NextGen CM/ECF, the latest iteration of the electronic case filing system. Use of the electronic filing system is mandatory for attorneys. If you intend to file documents and/or receive notice of docket activity in this case, please ensure you have completed the following steps:

- **Obtain a NextGen account.** Attorneys who had an e-filing account in this court prior to August 21, 2017 are required to update their legacy account in order to file documents in the NextGen system. Attorneys who have never had an e-filing account in this court must register for an account at www.pacer.gov. For information on updating your legacy account or registering for a new account, go to the court's website at www.ca1.uscourts.gov and select *E-Filing (Information)*.
- **Apply for admission to the bar of this court.** Attorneys who wish to e-file must be a member of the bar of this court. For information on attorney admissions, go to the court's website at www.ca1.uscourts.gov and select *Attorney Admissions* under the *Attorney & Litigants* tab. Bar admission is not required for attorneys who wish to receive notice of docket activity, but do not intend to e-file.
- **Review Local Rule 25.** For information on Loc. R. 25.0, which sets forth the rules governing electronic filing, go to the court's website at www.ca1.uscourts.gov and select *First Circuit Rulebook* under the *Rules & Procedures* tab.

United States Court of Appeals For the First Circuit

ORDER OF COURT

Entered: February 9, 2021

In response to recent disclosures of wide-spread breaches of both private sector and government computer systems, the Court has adopted new security procedures to protect any highly sensitive document (HSD) filed with the Court that, if improperly disclosed, could cause harm to the United States, the Federal Judiciary, litigants, or others.

HSDs are documents containing information that is likely to be of interest to the intelligence service of a foreign government and the use or disclosure of such information by a hostile foreign government would likely cause significant harm to the United States or its interests. Examples of HSDs include unclassified sealed documents involving national security, foreign sovereign interests, criminal activity related to cybersecurity or terrorism, investigation of public officials, and extremely sensitive commercial information likely to be of interest to foreign powers.

The following types of sealed documents, if they do not fall into one of the categories above, typically will not qualify as HSDs: (1) presentence reports and related documents; (2) pleadings related to cooperation in criminal cases; (3) Social Security records; (4) administrative immigration records; and (5) most sealed documents in civil cases.

The designation of a document as highly sensitive is typically made by the district court or originating agency. Documents that have previously been designated by the district court or an agency as highly sensitive will ordinarily be treated in the same manner by this court. See 1st Cir. R. 11.0(c)(1).

If a document qualifies as an HSD as that term is described above, a filer is required to file a motion to treat that document as an HSD. The movant must serve the motion and the proposed HSD on all other parties by mail with proof of service under Fed. R. App. P. 25(d)(1). The motion and each proposed HSD should be conspicuously marked as a “HIGHLY SENSITIVE DOCUMENT” and placed inside an envelope marked “HIGHLY SENSITIVE.” The motion to treat a document as an HSD should be filed contemporaneously with the filing of a motion to seal the document and should be filed in paper format only under the procedures and requirements of 1st Cir. R. 11.0(c). The motion must set forth in detail why the proposed document constitutes a highly sensitive document under the criteria set out in this order, including the specific grounds for asserting that the document contains information that is likely to be of interest to the intelligence service of a foreign government and the use or disclosure of such information by a hostile foreign government would likely cause significant harm to the United States or its interests. Conclusory assertions will not be deemed a sufficient basis for filing a motion to treat a sealed document as an HSD. If a filer believes that a previously filed document in an ongoing case before

the court qualifies as an HSD, a motion to treat the sealed document as an HSD may be filed. There is no need to file such a motion in a closed case.

/s/ Jeffrey R. Howard

Jeffrey R. Howard

Chief Judge

cc:

Emaan Ali Bangash

Alberto J. Bayouth-Montes

Jamie Leigh Bowers

Blair Lane Byrum

Robert Glenn Chadwick Jr.

Jonathan Crumly

James N. Henry Jr.

Sarah D. Holz

Edward P. Perrin Jr.

Antonio L. Roig-Lorenzo

United States Court of Appeals For the First Circuit

NOTICE TO ALL CM/ECF USERS REGARDING "NATIVE" PDF REQUIREMENT

All documents filed electronically with the court must be submitted as "native" Portable Document ("PDF") files. See 1st Cir R. 25.0. A **native PDF file** is created by electronically converting a word processing document to PDF using Adobe Acrobat or similar software. A **scanned PDF file** is created by putting a paper document through an optical scanner. Use a scanner **ONLY** if you do not have access to an electronic version of the document that would enable you to prepare a native PDF file. If you fail to file a document in the correct format, you will be asked to resubmit it.