

Case Nos: 23-35440, 23-35450

---

---

IN THE  
**UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE NINTH CIRCUIT**

---

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,  
*Plaintiff-Appellee*

v.

STATE OF IDAHO,  
*Defendant-Appellant*

v.

MIKE MOYLE, ET AL.,  
*Movants-Appellants*

---

On Appeal from the U.S. District Court for the District of Idaho  
Case No. 1:22-cv-00329-BLW  
The Honorable B. Lynn Winmill

---

**BRIEF OF WOMEN HURT BY ABORTION AS *AMICI CURIAE*  
IN SUPPORT OF APPELLANTS**

---

NATHAN T. SELTZER  
*Counsel of Record*  
*for Amici Curiae*  
ALLAN E. PARKER, JR.  
MARY J. BROWNING  
*Senior Attorneys*  
R. CLAYTON TROTTER  
*General Counsel*

THE JUSTICE FOUNDATION  
8023 Vantage Dr. Suite 1275  
San Antonio, TX 78233  
210-614-7157  
aparker@txjf.org

---

---

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	i
INDEX OF AUTHORITIES.....	ii
CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE .....	iv
INTEREST OF AMICI.....	1
SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT .....	3
ARGUMENT .....	5
I. Supremacy Clause preemption is not an independent legislative power, and cannot apply where the State has not accepted the “contract” offered by Congress under the Spending Clause.....	5
II. In the alternative, even if EMTALA bound States, EMTALA cannot demand a State perform abortions prohibited by the federal Hyde Amendment.....	27
III. Abortion is not healthcare and not within the ambit of EMTALA .....	30
CONCLUSION .....	40

## INDEX OF AUTHORITIES

### United States Supreme Court Cases

Alexander v. Sandoval, 532 U.S. 275 (2001).....	17
Armstrong v. Exceptional Child Ctr., Inc., 575 U.S. 320 (2015).....	6
Becerra v. Empire Health Found., 142 S. Ct. 2354 (2022).....	12
City of Arlington v. FCC, 569 U.S. 290 (2013) .....	21
Cruzan v. Dir., Mo. Dep’t of Health, 497 U.S. 261 (1990).....	31
Dobbs v. Jackson Women's Health Org., 142 S. Ct. 2228 (2022) ....	14, 31, 34, 41
FTC v. American Tobacco Co., 264 U.S. 298 (1924) .....	22
Gallardo v. Marstiller, 142 S. Ct. 1751 (2022).....	12
Gonzales v. Carhart, 550 U.S. 124 (2007) .....	34
Harris v. McRae, 448 U.S. 297 (1980).....	28, 30, 33
Helvering v. Davis, 301 U.S. 619 (1937).....	8
Maher v. Roe, 432 U.S. 464 (1977).....	33
Mazurek v. Armstrong, 520 U.S. 968 (1997) (reversed by Dobbs v. Jackson Women's Health Org., 597 U.S. 215 (2022) .....	37
Murphy v. NCAA, 584 U.S. 453 (2018).....	5
New York v. United States, 505 U.S. 144 (1992).....	5, 9
Planned Parenthood v. Casey, 505 U.S. 833 (1992) (reversed by Dobbs v. Jackson Women's Health Org., 597 U.S. 215 (2022) .....	38
Roe v. Wade, 410 U.S. 113 (1973) (reversed by Dobbs v. Jackson Women's Health Org., 597 U.S. 215 (2022) .....	2, 33
Rust v. Sullivan, 500 U.S. 173 (1991).....	22
Skinner v. Oklahoma, 316 U.S. 535 (1942) .....	33
South Dakota v. Dole, 483 U.S. 203 (1987).....	9
Whole Woman’s Health v. Hellerstedt, 579 U.S. 591 (2016) (reversed by Dobbs v. Jackson Women's Health Org., 597 U.S. 215 (2022).....	37

**Federal Cases**

Elizabeth Blackwell Health Ctr. for Women v. Knoll, 61 F.3d 170 (3d Cir. 1995) .....	15
Hope Medical Group for Women v. Edwards, 63 F.3d 418 (5th Cir. 1995) .....	15
Massachusetts v. Sebelius, 638 F.3d 24 (1st Cir 2011) .....	24, 25
Planned Parenthood Affiliates v. Engler, 73 F.3d 634 (6th Cir. 1996) .....	14, 15
Planned Parenthood Minn., N.D., S.D. v. Rounds, 530 F.3d 724 (8th Cir. 2008) (en banc) .....	33
Rodriguez v. Am. Int'l Ins. Co., 402 F.3d 45 (1st Cir. 2005) .....	20
Stuart v. Camnitz, 774 F.3d 238 (4th Cir. 2014) .....	38
United States v. Idaho, 83 F.4th 1130 (9th Cir. 2023) .....	27
Zelda v. Dublier, 741 Fed. Appx. 397 (9th Cir. 2018) .....	19

**Federal Statutes**

42 U.S.C. § 1395 .....	13, 26, 27
42 U.S.C. § 1395aa .....	25
42 U.S.C. § 1395cc .....	18
42 U.S.C. § 1395i-4 .....	26
42 U.S.C. § 1395v .....	25
42 U.S.C. § 1395z .....	25
42 U.S.C. § 1396-1 .....	6, 12
42 U.S.C. §§ 1395 et seq. (Medicare) .....	18
42 U.S.C. §§ 1396, et seq. (Medicaid) .....	27
5 U.S.C. § 706 .....	21
P.L. 117-328. Div. H, §§ 506–507 (Dec. 29, 2022) .....	29

**State Statutes**

S.D. Codified Laws § 34-23A-1 .....	32
S.D. Codified Laws § 34-23A-10.1 .....	33

**Other Authorities**

Memorandum: Reinforcement of EMTALA Obligations specific to Patients who are Pregnant or are Experiencing Pregnancy Loss (QSO-22-22-Hospitals), Dep't of Health & Human Serv., July 11, 2022 .....	7
---	---

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a copy of this Motion has been filed by the Court's electronic filing system on this the 20<sup>th</sup> day of September, 2024, with service to:

Nicolas S. Crown  
Counsel of Record for Appellee  
US Department of Justice  
950 Pennsylvania Ave, NW  
Washington, DC 20530  
[Nicolas.crown@usdoj.gov](mailto:Nicolas.crown@usdoj.gov)

and to:

Daniel W. Bower  
Counsel of Record for Appellant  
Hilty, Bower, Haws & Seable, PLLC  
1303 12th Avenue Road  
Nampa, ID 83686  
[dbower@morrisbowerhaws.com](mailto:dbower@morrisbowerhaws.com)

Respectfully Submitted,

/s/ Nathan Seltzer  
NATHAN T. SELTZER  
*Counsel of Record for Amici Curiae*  
THE JUSTICE FOUNDATION  
8023 Vantage Dr., Suite 1275  
San Antonio, TX 78230  
(210) 614-7157  
[nseltzer@thejusticefoundation.org](mailto:nseltzer@thejusticefoundation.org)

## INTEREST OF AMICI<sup>1</sup>

*Amici* 2,739 Women Injured by Abortion<sup>2</sup> are women who were injured by their own abortions and their abortionists. Most of the *Amici* Women Injured by Abortion suffered grievous psychological injuries, but many suffered severe physical complications as well. All were exposed to the risk of serious physical injury, as well as serious psychological injuries,<sup>3</sup> and thus have a profound interest in protecting

---

<sup>1</sup> No counsel for a party authored this brief in whole or in part, and no counsel or party made a monetary contribution intended to fund the preparation or submission of this brief. No person other than amici curiae, its members, or its counsel made a monetary contribution to its preparation or submission. All parties consented to the submission of this brief.

<sup>2</sup> Attached as Appendix 1 is the list of the initials, first names, or full names of the *Amici Curiae* Women. To protect their identities, some of the women have requested that we use initials or first name only. These women's sworn affidavits or declarations made under penalty of perjury are on file at The Justice Foundation. Protecting the identity of women who have had abortions or seek abortions has been customary since *Roe v. Wade*, 410 U.S. 113 (1973) and *Doe v. Bolton*, 410 U.S. 179 (1973) where *Roe* and *Doe* both were pseudonyms.

Link to Appendix:  
<https://www.dropbox.com/scl/fo/c51kufzrilpfcfdu3uh2r/h?rlkey=se5iq7ycbs98y0z97epctc7jv&dl=0>.

<sup>3</sup> See, e.g. "Women who had undergone an abortion experienced an 81% increased risk of mental health problems, and nearly 10% of the incidence of mental health problems was shown to be attributable to abortion." See Coleman, Priscilla, "Abortion and Mental Health: Quantitative Synthesis and Analysis of Research Published 1995-2009," *The British Journal of Psychiatry* (2011) 199, 180-186, DOI: 10.1192/bjp.bp.110.07723. (A meta-analysis of 22 studies.)

other women from such injuries. All of the *Amici* Women have experienced abortion.

*Amici* Women have experienced first-hand—some multiple times—the callous reality of the abortion industry. They and the vast majority of women who go to high volume abortion facilities are treated as a business asset or customer, not as a patient. Therefore, the word "patient" will not be used in this Brief because there is no real doctor/patient relationship in most abortion facilities, only the technical or legal fiction of a doctor/patient relationship. It is standard practice for a woman to not even see her doctor until she has paid her money and is prepped for the abortion. With the increased use of chemical abortion and telemedicine abortion, this “relationship” is even more attenuated and transactional. A normal doctor-patient relationship does not exist despite the fundamental expectation espoused in *Roe v. Wade*, 410 U.S. 113 (1973) (reversed by *Dobbs v. Jackson Women's Health Org.*, 597 U.S. 215 (2022) (hereafter “*Roe*”). *Amici* Women

demonstrate there was no "successful communication which "fosters trust and supports shared decision making."<sup>4</sup>

## SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT

### I.

Under the Spending Clause of the Constitution, States may only be bound by federal laws infringing on their historic police powers when a “contract” is created between the State and the federal government. No such contract exists within Medicare, of which EMTALA is a part.

### II.

Even if the Court somehow concluded that EMTALA was binding on States, EMTALA is still part of Medicare. Medicare is subject to the Hyde Amendment, which prohibits federal funds for abortions except in case of rape, incest or the life of the mother. Idaho’s statute protecting life provides substantially the same exceptions as the Hyde Amendment, so there is no conflict with Idaho’s statute protecting life.

---

<sup>4</sup> American Medical Association, Council on Ethical and Judicial Affairs, Opinion 2.1.1 Informed Consent <https://www.ama-assn.org/delivering-care/ethics/informed-consent>



III.

Abortion is a medical procedure, but it is not healthcare. As a medical procedure, abortion is in the category of euthanasia and execution by lethal injection. Its purpose is the death of a human being, not healthcare.

## ARGUMENT

### I. Supremacy Clause preemption is not an independent legislative power, and cannot apply where the State has not accepted the “contract” offered by Congress under the Spending Clause

#### A. Supremacy Clause preemption of State law is not a separate grant of legislative power

---

For preemption to apply, a federal statute “must represent the exercise of a power conferred on Congress by the Constitution; pointing to the Supremacy Clause will not do.” *Murphy v. NCAA*, 584 U.S. 453, 477 (2018). This is because “the Framers explicitly chose a Constitution that confers upon Congress the power to regulate individuals, not States.” *New York v. United States*, 505 U.S. 144, 166 (1992).

Here, the United States and the District Court have erroneously dealt with preemption as if it is a separate power of Congress. But the Supreme Court has explained that preemption merely determines who wins a conflict. It cannot create a conflict, and it cannot invalidate a duly enacted State law without an independent grant of authority. *Murphy*, 584 U.S. at 477 (“Preemption is based on the Supremacy Clause,

and that Clause is not an independent grant of legislative power to Congress. Instead, it simply provides ‘a rule of decision.’”) (citing *Armstrong v. Exceptional Child Ctr., Inc.*, 575 U.S. 320, 324 (2015)).

B. EMTALA does not create or reference any contract between the States and the federal government

Other parties have correctly argued that the Medicare “contract” and associated EMTALA restrictions do not impose abortion (or any other specific procedure) on Medicare participating hospitals. As those briefs show, that decision is left by EMTALA to the States.

However, before even reaching the question of what terms are imposed by the Medicare “contract,” the United States must pass the threshold issue of showing that such a “contract” was ever intended and created by Congress. Congress avoided creating such a contract by forgoing the State participation section that is present in various other Spending Clause legislation, such as Medicaid. See, e.g., 42 U.S.C. § 1396-1 (“The sums made available under this section

shall be used for making payments to States which have submitted, and had approved by the Secretary, State plans for medical assistance.”). And, in this case, the United States has not even attempted to show that Congress made such provision.

Without Congressional authority to preempt State laws relating to the practice of medicine, HHS may not claim federal law preempts a State law relating to the practice of medicine.

Yet, the HHS Secretary’s guidance unlawfully attempts to radically expand EMTALA’s statutory authority by claiming “[a]nd when a state law prohibits abortion and does not include an exception for the life and health of the pregnant person — or draws the exception more narrowly than EMTALA’s emergency medical condition definition — that state law is preempted.”<sup>5</sup>

---

<sup>5</sup> *Memorandum: Reinforcement of EMTALA Obligations specific to Patients who are Pregnant or are Experiencing Pregnancy Loss (QSO-22-22-Hospitals)*, Dep’t of Health & Human Serv., July 11, 2022 (emphasis in original).

The same assertion of authority expressed in the guidance also formed the basis for this case. As explained below, this guidance is *ultra vires*.

1. *EMTALA is part of Medicare and therefore part of the Social Security Act, which is authorized under the Spending Clause*

As Title XVIII of the Social Security Act, Medicare is constitutional under the Spending Clause. *See Helvering v. Davis*, 301 U.S. 619, 645 (1937). EMTALA was enacted as part of Medicare. Therefore, like the rest of the Social Security Act, EMTALA is bound by the Constitutional restrictions of the Spending Clause. Even the DOJ does not dispute that EMTALA’s validity stems from the Spending Clause. *See, e.g.* U.S. Gov’t C.A. Panel Br. 44 (“EMTALA reflects Congress’s broad power under the Spending Clause to set the terms on which it disburses federal funds.”) (internal quotations omitted).

Congress may authorize federal spending even where it may not directly regulate. “[T]he constitutional limitations on Congress when exercising its spending power are less

exacting than those on its authority to regulate directly.”  
*South Dakota v. Dole*, 483 U.S. 203, 209 (1987).

However, spending clause legislation comes with a very important caveat.

The Supreme Court held that: “The legitimacy of Congress' power to legislate under the spending power thus rests on whether the State voluntarily and knowingly accepts the terms of the ‘contract.’ . . . [W]e enable the States to *exercise their choice* knowingly, cognizant of the consequences of their participation.” *Pennhurst State Sch. & Hosp. v. Halderman*, 451 U.S. 1, 17 (1981) (emphasis added).

This contract can entice States to surrender their autonomy in exchange for Federal funds. “Where the recipient of federal funds is a State, as is not unusual today, the conditions attached to the funds by Congress may influence a State's legislative choices.” *New York*, 505 U.S. at 167.

No contract between the Federal and State governments is present in EMTALA, or in Medicare generally. States do not—

and cannot—exercise choice over Medicare, because Medicare is active in every State regardless of State participation.

Yet, in this case, all of DOJ’s arguments have merely pointed to the Supremacy Clause and EMTALA’s provisions, without looking at the Constitutional source of legislative power exercised by Congress. *See, e.g.* Compl. at 3 (“To the extent Idaho’s law prohibits doctors from providing medically necessary treatment, including abortions, that EMTALA requires as emergency medical care, Idaho’s new abortion law directly conflicts with EMTALA.”).

Although DOJ’s complaint has an entire section entitled “Idaho’s Abortion Law Conflicts with EMTALA,” that section also never alleges that Idaho accepted the Federal Medicare contract. Compl. 9–11.

The same is true in their brief before the Ninth Circuit panel, below. Despite spending more than four pages attempting to articulate a conflict between EMTALA and Idaho Code § 18-622, the DOJ never mentions the Federal contract required of Spending Clause statutes under

*Pennhurst*. See U.S. Gov’t C.A. Panel Br. 26-30. The DOJ does not make this argument even though it dedicates a section of its brief to the Spending Clause. See U.S. Gov’t C.A. Panel Br. 44–45. This absence demonstrates the weakness of the DOJ position, and the omission is fatal to DOJ’s case.

Because the DOJ *never attempts* to demonstrate the enforceability of EMTALA in the face of a conflict with Idaho law, the Court may end its inquiry here and dismiss the case.

2. *Unlike Medicaid, Medicare does not create a contract between States and the federal government*

The Supreme Court has repeatedly held that a Spending Clause contract is created by an intentional act of Congress that constitutes an offer, and an act by the State that constitutes an acceptance. *Pennhurst State Sch. & Hosp. v. Halderman*, 451 U.S. 1, 17 (1981) (“[L]egislation enacted pursuant to the spending power is much in the nature of a contract: in return for federal funds, the States agree to comply with federally imposed conditions.”).



Medicare and Medicaid are administered by the same agency and were created at the same time, but have very different modes of operation. Medicaid is a federal program offering funding to States in exchange for creating a medical program. *Gallardo v. Marsteller*, 142 S. Ct. 1751, 1755 (2022) (“States participating in Medicaid must comply with the Medicaid Act’s requirements or risk losing Medicaid funding.”) (cleaned up). On the other hand, Medicare is a program offered to individuals, in which medical service providers may choose to participate. *Becerra v. Empire Health Found.*, 142 S. Ct. 2354, 2359 (2022) (“The Medicare program provides Government-funded health insurance to over 64 million elderly or disabled Americans.”) and *Ibid.* (“The Medicare program pays a hospital a fixed rate for treating each Medicare patient . . .”).

By its text and Congressional intent, Medicaid creates a Federal-State contract. Medicaid provides that it is only effective in States which join the program. 42 U.S.C. § 1396-1 (“The sums made available under this section shall be used

for making payments to States which have submitted, and had approved by the Secretary, State plans for medical assistance.”).

By contrast, Medicare became effective for individuals throughout the United States when enacted. States had no option to accept or reject Medicare becoming effective in their States or for their citizens at passage, nor can any State opt out of Medicare. Qualifying individuals may choose whether or not to join Medicare, and medical service providers may choose whether or not to participate, but States have no such choice.

Therefore, Medicaid provides the terms and reciprocal obligations necessary for contract formation between the Federal government and States. Medicare does not.

If Congress had wanted EMTALA obligations to apply to States, Congress could have chosen to place EMTALA in Medicaid. Instead, Congress intentionally placed EMTALA within Medicare, making EMTALA subject to 42 U.S.C. § 1395 (“*Nothing in this title* [42 U.S.C. §§ 1395 et seq.] shall

be construed to authorize *any Federal officer or employee* to exercise *any supervision or control* over the *practice of medicine* or the manner in which medical services are provided . . .”). Under the Spending Clause, EMTALA must be part of a federal-State contract to bind states. There is no contract.

3. *Medicaid cases that required abortion hinged on the State’s voluntary participation in Medicaid*

States laws protecting infant life were preempted in the past by Medicaid, but the holding of every Court to examine it has depended on voluntary State participation in Medicaid.

Each federal appellate court to examine the issue has concluded that State laws more restrictive than Medicaid were preempted under the Supremacy Clause. *Planned Parenthood Affiliates v. Engler*, 73 F.3d 634, 638 (6th Cir. 1996) (collecting cases).

The precedential value of these cases is highly questionable in light of *Dobbs v. Jackson Women’s Health Org.*, 142 S. Ct. 2228, 2238 (2022) (“Roe and Casey have led to the distortion

of many important but unrelated legal doctrines, and that effect provides further support for overruling those decisions.”). *Amici* would argue those cases are now overruled *sub silentio* by *Dobbs*, if the issue were before the Court.

However, regardless of *Dobbs*’ implications, these holdings relied upon State participation in Medicaid for federal authority. *Engler*, 73 F.3d, at 638; *Hope Medical Group for Women v. Edwards*, 63 F.3d 418, 425 (5th Cir. 1995); *Elizabeth Blackwell Health Ctr. for Women v. Knoll*, 61 F.3d 170, 172 (3d Cir. 1995).

These cases uniformly make clear that States subject themselves to Medicaid funding restrictions *only* by choosing to participate in Medicaid. The Supreme Court held that: “The legitimacy of Congress’ power to legislate under the spending power thus rests on whether the State voluntarily and knowingly accepts the terms of the ‘contract.’ . . . [W]e enable the States to *exercise their choice* knowingly, cognizant of the consequences of their participation.” *Pennhurst State Sch. & Hosp. v. Halderman*, 451 U.S. 1, 17 (1981) (emphasis added).

It follows that States would *not* be subject to Medicaid funding restrictions if they did *not* participate in Medicaid.

In the same way that a State choosing not to participate in Medicaid cannot have its duly enacted laws preempted by Medicaid, a State that cannot participate in Medicare cannot have its duly enacted laws preempted by Medicare. The only possible exception is that the United States may potentially vindicate a statutory right created by EMTALA. *See* discussion in I.C, *infra*.

4. *The typical remedy for a State failing to comply with conditions in Spending Clause legislation is to terminate funds to the State—an impossibility here.*

As articulated by the Supreme Court in *Pennhurst*, the federal government's expected course to enforce Spending Clause legislation against States is to cut off State funds. *Pennhurst*, 451 U.S., at 28 (“In legislation enacted pursuant to the spending power, the typical remedy for state noncompliance with federally imposed conditions is not a private cause of action for noncompliance but rather *action by the Federal Government to terminate funds to the State.*”). In

other words, if the State violates the contract, the federal government is not obligated to continue funding it.

The “typical” action described in *Pennhurst* is impossible here because there are no funds to terminate. There are no State funds connected to EMTALA to terminate because *there is no contract*.

C. EMTALA creates limited federal statutory rights which only provide remedies against *hospitals* and *physicians*

1. *EMTALA* statutory rights and remedies are fully described within the *EMTALA* statute

The Supreme Court has held that statutory remedies tend to foreclose implied remedies. *Alexander v. Sandoval*, 532 U.S. 275, 290 (2001) (“The express provision of one method of enforcing a substantive rule suggests that Congress intended to preclude others.”).

The statutory rights and remedies created by EMTALA are fully described in the enforcement section of the EMTALA statute. 42 U.S.C. § 1395dd(d). Federal government remedies include the right of the Secretary of HHS to sanction a hospital (§ 1395dd(d)(1)(A)), or sanction a physician

(§ 1395dd(d)(1)(B)). In addition to this EMTALA-specific remedy, Medicare allows the Secretary to terminate a hospital's participation in the Medicare program for multiple reasons, including non-compliance with EMTALA. 42 U.S.C. § 1395cc(b)(2) (“The Secretary may . . . terminate such an agreement after the Secretary . . . has determined that the provider fails to comply substantially with the provisions of the agreement, with the provisions of this title [42 U.S.C. §§ 1395 et seq.] and regulations thereunder[.]”). Neither EMTALA nor Medicare generally has any such termination provision with respect to States—because States do not participate in EMTALA or Medicare generally. These statutorily prescribed remedies by HHS involve the only parties that the EMTALA statute binds—hospitals and physicians.

The EMTALA statute also creates private rights of action for an individual to obtain damages for EMTALA violations by a hospital (§ 1395dd(d)(2)(A)) and for a medical facility to obtain damages for EMTALA violations by another hospital

(§ 1395dd(d)(2)(B)). All of these causes of action may only be brought against hospitals which choose to participate in Medicare. *See, e.g.*, § 1395dd(d)(2)(A) (“Any individual who suffers personal harm as a direct result of a *participating hospital’s violation* of a requirement of this section may, in a civil action against the participating hospital, obtain those damages available for personal injury *under the law of the State* in which the hospital is located, and such equitable relief as is appropriate.”) (emphasis added); § 1395dd(d)(1)(B) (“Any medical facility that suffers a financial loss as a direct result of a participating hospital’s violation of a requirement of this section may, in a civil action against the participating hospital, obtain those damages available for financial loss, *under the law of the State* in which the hospital is located, and such equitable relief as is appropriate.”).

Every appellate Court to examine it, including this circuit, has held that only Medicare participating hospitals are liable under EMTALA. *See, e.g., Zelda v. Dublier*, 741 Fed. Appx. 397, 399 (9th Cir. 2018) (“Thus, as the EMTALA only provides



a form of redress against a participating hospital, the only proper Defendant in this matter is Harborview Medical Center.”); *Rodriguez v. Am. Int’l Ins. Co.*, 402 F.3d 45, 47 (1st Cir. 2005) (“EMTALA imposed some limited substantive requirements on emergency rooms of hospitals participating in the federal Medicare program.”).

These cases uniformly interpret EMTALA to provide limited statutory rights for certain individuals against hospitals and for the HHS Secretary against physicians and hospitals.

Critically, the provided actions never discuss remedies against States or State laws, except a single boilerplate preemption clause. See 42 U.S.C. § 1395dd(f) (“The provisions of this section do not preempt any State or local law requirement, except to the extent that the requirement directly conflicts with a requirement of this section.”). The United States’ complaint hangs its *entire case* on this provision by relying on mere conclusory legal statements.

2. *The United States’ assertion of authority requires violating the basic canon of statutory interpretation that Courts should presume Congress was acting Constitutionally*

Any federal regulatory action which requires more authority than what is conferred by Congress is *ultra vires* under the Administrative Procedures Act. 5 U.S.C. § 706(2)(C) (“The reviewing court shall . . . hold unlawful and set aside agency action, findings, and conclusions found to be . . . in excess of statutory jurisdiction, authority, or limitations, or short of statutory right.”); *Accord City of Arlington v. FCC*, 569 U.S. 290, 299 (2013) (“To exceed authorized application is to exceed authority.”). If this Court discerns that HHS’ assertion of authority would conflict with State law, but the EMTALA statutory text (which provides authority for HHS action) would not conflict with State law, then the Court may end its inquiry by finding the HHS assertion of its authority is *ultra vires*.

The HHS assertion of authority in this case requires that the Court construe EMTALA and Medicare outside the bounds of the Spending Clause, upon which its authority

rests. Congress could not have intended EMTALA to preempt State laws regulating the practice of medicine, because Congress placed EMTALA within Medicare, a Spending Clause statute with no State-Federal contract. *See* Section I.B.1, *supra*.

HHS' assertion of authority therefore requires an unconstitutional interpretation of EMTALA. But Courts must construe statutes in a way that does not violate the Constitution, if possible. *Rust v. Sullivan*, 500 U.S. 173, 191 (1991) (“[A] statute must be construed, if fairly possible, so as to avoid not only the conclusion that it is unconstitutional but also grave doubts upon that score.’ This canon is followed out of respect for Congress, which we assume legislates in the light of constitutional limitations.”) (citing *FTC v. American Tobacco Co.*, 264 U.S. 298, 305-307 (1924)).

Therefore, this principle forecloses any HHS argument that EMTALA contains provisions that preempt State laws regulating the practice of medicine.

*3. Idaho's abortion law does not interfere with the statutory rights created by EMTALA*

A state law could only conflict with the objects and purposes of EMTALA if the law interfered with the statutory rights of patients or medical facilities to sue hospitals (for example, by immunizing hospitals from EMTALA suits created by 42 U.S.C. § 1395dd(d)) or if the law required patient dumping (which would interfere with a patient's statutory rights granted under § 1395dd(c)). Abortion is nowhere in sight among these rights. Because the Idaho statute does not contravene the objects and purposes of EMTALA, and complying with EMTALA and state law is possible, there is no preemption.

The federal government states that hospitals are placed in the impossible position of complying with HHS guidance and Idaho statute. This is only true if we assume its conclusory legal statement (which is completely unsupported) about EMTALA is true. Compl. at 3 (“To the extent Idaho’s law prohibits doctors from providing medically necessary treatment, including abortions, that EMTALA requires as

emergency medical care, Idaho's new abortion law directly conflicts with EMTALA.""). As discussed in Section I.B.2, *supra*, the federal government never even alleges the State-Federal contract required for such broad preemption to exist.

HHS is quite correct that it is not possible to comply with Idaho statute and its own EMTALA *guidance*. But that conflict is by the design of HHS, not Congress. It is quite possible to comply with Idaho statute and the EMTALA *statute*. This places the HHS guidance outside the authority of the EMTALA statute and the HHS guidance is therefore *ultra vires*.

#### 4. *States are ineligible to receive funds under Medicare*

The principle that States may not be paid by Medicare has been consistently applied by Courts of Appeals. See *Massachusetts v. Sebelius*, 638 F.3d 24, 28 (1st Cir 2011). States may not directly apply for Medicare reimbursements, where the State Medicaid agency improperly paid for services. Instead, the doctor or hospital which provided the services

must refund the money to the State Medicaid agency, and the provider must then seek reimbursement under Medicare.

This is the exact position advocated by the Center for Medicare and Medicaid Services (“CMS”) in cases involving Medicare payments to States. *Ibid.* (“CMS wrote that ‘there is no statutory authority under Medicare to allow a state to seek recovery and be paid directly from Medicare’ because ‘Medicare allows only providers to bill and be paid by Medicare.’”)

The only mechanisms within Medicare that involve the States are ancillary agreements for state agencies to provide HHS with information on medical providers within the States and for Federal grants. See, e.g., 42 U.S.C. § 1395aa(a) (statutory authority to enter agreement with States to assess compliance of service providers); 42 U.S.C. § 1395z (statutory authority to consult with State agencies to develop conditions for participation by service providers in Medicare Part E); 42 U.S.C. § 1395v (statutory authority for HHS to form agreements with States to automatically enroll eligible

citizens in Medicare Part B). These ancillary agreements have no impact on whether Medicare becomes or remains operative in the State. In addition, these agreements are entirely self-contained, with their own conditions and reciprocal obligations for Federal and State participation. See, e.g. 42 U.S.C. § 1395i-4 (providing grants for States that establish Rural Hospital Flexibility Programs, along with the requirements for State participation). Individuals and medical service providers within the State remain eligible for services and reimbursement regardless of State participation in these ancillary agreements. And all agreements remain subject to Medicare's first section, which prohibits Federal interference in the practice of medicine within a State. 42 U.S.C. § 1395 ("Nothing in this title [Medicare] shall be construed to authorize any Federal officer or employee to exercise any supervision or control over the practice of medicine or the manner in which medical services are provided . . .").

If EMTALA had been placed in Medicaid (42 U.S.C. §§ 1396, et seq.), then § 1395 would not apply. There is no provision in Medicaid that is comparable to § 1395. In addition, States would have the option to accept or decline EMTALA funding restrictions to participate in Medicaid. Congress instead chose to place EMTALA within Medicare, 42 U.S.C. § 1395dd. Courts and HHS must respect Congress' decision not to require States to conform their health regulations to EMTALA or any other Medicare funding restrictions.

In its decision below, the Ninth Circuit panel succinctly observed that “improperly preventing Idaho from enforcing its duly enacted laws and general police power also undermines the State's public interest in self-governance free from unwarranted federal interference.” *United States v. Idaho*, 83 F.4th 1130, 1140 (9th Cir. 2023).

**II. In the alternative, even if EMTALA bound States, EMTALA cannot demand a State perform abortions prohibited by the federal Hyde Amendment**



A. The federal government may not compel a State to provide services that Congress is unwilling to fund

---

The Supreme Court examined the impact of the Hyde Amendment on abortion mandates in *Harris v. McRae*, 448 U.S. 297 (1980). At the time of *Harris*, abortions were only federally-funded under the Hyde Amendment where necessary to save the life of the mother. HHS claimed that States were still required to perform abortions deemed medically necessary, even if they were not funded because of Hyde.

After upholding the constitutionality of the Hyde Amendment, the *Harris* Court held that the Federal government could not use Medicaid to require States to allow abortions that were not funded by Hyde. *Id.* at 309 (“Title XIX [Medicaid] was designed as a cooperative program of *shared* financial responsibility, not as a device for the Federal Government to compel a State to provide services that Congress itself is unwilling to fund.”) (emphasis added).

This settles the issue. Any abortions that are not funded because of Hyde are also not required by Medicare, which includes Hyde language.

B. The Hyde Amendment prohibits Federal funds from being used for abortions except to save the life of the mother or in cases of rape and incest

---

The fiscal year 2023 version of the Hyde Amendment, as applicable to both Medicare and Medicaid, is P.L. 117-328. Div. H, §§ 506–507 (Dec. 29, 2022). The language of Hyde prohibits funding for abortions in § 506(a) (“None of the funds appropriated in this Act, and none of the funds in any trust fund to which funds are appropriated in this Act, shall be expended for any abortion.”) but allows funding for certain abortions in § 507(a) (abortions are funded “if the pregnancy is the result of an act of rape or incest; or in the case where a woman suffers from a physical disorder, physical injury, or physical illness, including a life-endangering physical condition caused by or arising from the pregnancy itself, that would, as certified by a physician, place the woman in danger of death unless an abortion is performed.”).

Taken as a whole, the 2023 Hyde amendment only provides funds for abortions in cases of rape, incest or to save the life of the mother. This specifically does not fund abortions as claimed in the DOJ's complaint. Compl. at 10 ("For example, EMTALA requires stabilizing treatment where "the health" of the patient is "in serious jeopardy," or where continuing a pregnancy could result in a "serious impairment to bodily functions" or a "serious dysfunction of any bodily organ or part."). The scenarios alleged by DOJ are not within the ambit of Hyde and therefore DOJ's claims that these preempt State law is contrary to Supreme Court precedent in *Harris*, 448 U.S. at 309 (the Federal Government may not "compel a State to provide services that Congress itself is unwilling to fund.").

Hyde completely forecloses any theory that EMTALA could require abortions that Hyde does not fund.

### **III. Abortion is not healthcare and not within the ambit of EMTALA**

A. Abortion is not healthcare under EMTALA, the Constitution, or the ordinary meaning of the term

---

Merriam-Webster defines health care as “efforts made to maintain, restore, or promote someone’s physical, mental, or emotional well-being especially when performed by trained and licensed professionals.” *Killing* another human being (as with an abortion) does not maintain, restore, or promote *the killed* human’s well-being, and therefore does not fall within this definition.

The Supreme Court has specifically excluded acts which kill a human being from substantive due process protections, including the right to abortion and the right to suicide. *See, e.g. Cruzan v. Dir., Mo. Dep’t of Health*, 497 U.S. 261, 280 (1990) (“We do not think a State is required to remain neutral in the face of an informed and voluntary decision by a physically able adult to starve to death.”); *Dobbs v. Jackson Women’s Health Org.*, 597 U.S. 215, 250 (2022) (“The inescapable conclusion is that a right to abortion is not deeply rooted in the Nation’s history and traditions.”). The logical inference from these cases is that abortion is not healthcare under the Constitution.

Within EMTALA, the type of healthcare required is “Necessary stabilizing treatment for emergency medical conditions and labor.” 42 U.S.C. § 1395dd(b). This requires that the hospital provide “such treatment as may be required to stabilize the medical condition.” § 1395dd(b)(1)(A). The act further defines emergency medical condition to include conditions “placing the health of the individual (or, with respect to a pregnant woman, the health of the woman or her unborn child) in serious jeopardy.” § 1395dd(1)(A)(i).

The strong inference is that abortion is perhaps the *only procedure categorically prohibited* by the statutory text of EMTALA, at least in the case of a woman in labor.

B. An abortion is the intentional termination of the life of a whole, separate, unique, living human being

Abortion is defined at law in South Dakota as “the intentional termination of the life of a human being in the uterus.” S.D. Codified Laws § 34-23A-1(1). The Eighth Circuit upheld a South Dakota law requiring doctors to tell mothers that “the abortion will terminate the life of a whole, separate,

unique, living human being” even under the old *Roe* framework. S.D. Codified Laws § 34-23A-10.1(1)(b). *See Planned Parenthood Minn., N.D., S.D. v. Rounds*, 530 F.3d 724, 737-738 (8th Cir. 2008) (en banc) (the required statutory disclosure is “truthful, non-misleading and relevant to the patient's decision to have an abortion[.]”).

Even under the now-defunct *Roe* framework, the Supreme Court frequently held that abortion is *sui generis*. *Harris v. McRae*, 448 U.S. 297, 325 (1980) (“Abortion is inherently different from other medical procedures, because no other procedure involves the purposeful termination of a potential life.”).

Idaho women have a federal Constitutional right to keep their children. *Maher v. Roe*, 432 U.S. 464, 472 (1977) (citing *Skinner v. Oklahoma*, 316 U.S. 535, 541 (1942)) (“Indeed, the right of procreation without state interference has long been recognized as “one of the basic civil rights of man... fundamental to the very existence and survival of the race.”). But no one has a federal Constitutional right to kill a child.

*See generally Dobbs v. Jackson Women's Health Org.*, 597 U.S. 215 (2022).

*1. Taking a life is not healthcare, even when it is a medical procedure*

Abortion is the killing of an infant life at the moment of the abortion. In *Gonzales v. Carhart*, 550 U.S. 124, 159 (2007) the Supreme Court stated, "...it seems unexceptionable to conclude some women come to regret their choice to abort the infant life they once created and sustained." Elective abortion is similar in kind to other non-healthcare medical procedures. Medical procedures which involve intentionally killing a human being include euthanasia, execution by lethal injection, and abortion. These procedures are not healthcare.

*Amici* Women Injured by Abortion testify to the truth of the statement that abortion took the life of their child. Here is what they experienced:

Jennifer

"Abortion has been the most destructive and hurtful thing in my life. I wasn't told about the many emotional consequences, I was expected to just move on. After my abortion, I felt hollow on the inside. A part of me died that day, physically and emotionally

in addition to the killing of my own baby... Abortion destroyed my life for 12 years. I had issues with severe depression, I had suicidal thoughts shortly after, I hated myself for choosing the abortion.”

Mary Lee

“The moment I walked out the door of the abortion clinic I was different. Not only the physical pain I had but the emotional pain was so deep I didn’t understand. I started drinking heavily to deaden the pain. I kept it a secret for 20 years and it ate a huge hole in my heart. Every time I saw or heard the word abortion I would cry and go into a dark depression period. Every Year around the anniversary of my abortion I would sob uncontrollably and would be depressed for weeks.”

Joanne

“I don't feel that the people running the clinic explained that the pain would last a long time. I almost died from my abortion. The doctor left part of the baby and placenta attached and I was rushed in to emergency surgery to stop hemorrhaging. I was told it would be quick and painless. But, I was hurt very deeply and it wasn’t painless physically either.”

What *Amici* experienced was not healthcare. Their pain was not from the lingering physical effects of a medical procedure, but from the medical certainty that they killed their own children.



Many amici women report being told their child was a “clump of cells” or “mass of tissue” being removed from their bodies—like liposuction—not an infant being killed.

M.C. from Michigan

“I was told there would be minor cramping, it would be very fast, there would be minor pain, the fetus would not feel anything, it was not developed enough to feel pain yet. I can say that was the worst pain I have ever felt in my life, I asked them to stop almost as soon as it started and I was told they couldn't stop. It was dangerous and I needed to be quiet. I was scaring the other patients with my yelling and crying. Two other staff members came in to hold me still and quiet me.”

S. from Georgia

“I was told there were no consequences or adverse effects from the abortion. It would be just like having a bad period afterward would be the worst side effect. The guilt I felt was quite extreme and I still deal with it sometimes. My periods became much worse (very heavy bleeding and cramping that I have had to have surgery for). My next pregnancy was not able to come to full term due to the placenta not staying attached to the uterus. If it were illegal I never would have done it.”

Suzanne

“I was not told it was a living baby. I was told it was a blob of tissue and it was the best solution for me, a 16 yr. old girl. I was not told of the hurt or the sense of emptiness, guilt and shame that I would feel. I was not told of the lingering pain.”

These quotes are the tip of the iceberg for the 2,739 *amici* who have joined together for this brief.

*2. The abortion industry argues it should not be held to the standards of healthcare practitioners*

The abortion industry routinely rejects and argues against basic healthcare standards being applied to them.

For example, the abortion industry has argued for decades in Court that its abortion providers need not be doctors. *Mazurek v. Armstrong*, 520 U.S. 968, 969-970 (1997) (reversed by *Dobbs v. Jackson Women's Health Org.*, 597 U.S. 215 (2022) (“The Montana law was challenged almost immediately by respondents, who are a group of licensed physicians and one physician-assistant practicing in Montana.”).

It has argued that its practitioners need not have admitting privileges in a nearby hospital. *Whole Woman's Health v. Hellerstedt*, 579 U.S. 582, 591 (2016) (“[A] group of Texas abortion providers filed an action in Federal District

Court seeking facial invalidation of the law’s admitting-privileges provision.”).

It has argued that it need not provide patients with written informed consent. *Planned Parenthood v. Casey*, 505 U.S. 833, 845 (1992) (reversed by *Dobbs v. Jackson Women's Health Org.*, 597 U.S. 215 (2022) (“the petitioners, who are five abortion clinics and one physician representing himself as well as a class of physicians who provide abortion services, brought this suit seeking declaratory and injunctive relief. Each provision was challenged as unconstitutional on its face.” The challenged provisions included written informed consent.).

It has argued it does not need to provide patients with ultrasounds. See e.g. *Stuart v. Camnitz*, 774 F.3d 238, 245 (4th Cir. 2014) (“The physicians urge us to find that the [ultrasound] regulation must receive strict scrutiny because it is content-based and ideological.”).

In short, the abortion industry has maintained for generations that it is different in kind from healthcare

practitioners. *Amici* and the abortion industry appear to agree that abortion is not healthcare.

The federal government assumes the opposite, without argument. It argues that not only is abortion healthcare, but that abortion is necessary healthcare under EMTALA. Compl. at 2 (“In some circumstances, medical care that a state may characterize as an ‘abortion’ is necessary emergency stabilizing care that hospitals are required to provide under EMTALA.”). Furthermore, by claiming that Medicare-participating hospitals must perform abortions, the Federal government is recruiting emergency room doctors—actual purveyors of healthcare—to perform abortions. In effect, this argument attempts to convert every Medicare-participating hospital in the United States into a *de facto* abortion clinic.

*3. Procedures like ectopic pregnancy removal are healthcare, not abortions, because the taking of human life is not the aim*

Removing an ectopic pregnancy is not a criminal abortion because the purpose of the removal is to save the life of the mother, not to kill the child.

However, “terminating a pregnancy,” when *not* medically necessary to save the life of the mother has the purpose of killing the child. This is a criminal abortion, because it is the purposeful killing of a child.

It is illogical to claim that EMTALA requires killing an infant for a cause *other than* saving the life of the mother, because this places the procedure outside of the healthcare arena, into an elective *physical* procedure not intended to preserve the patient’s *physical* health.

Medicare does not deal with healthcare regulations or criminal behavior. States retain complete power to regulate healthcare and criminal activity, so far as Medicare is concerned.

Doctors and/or patients can’t transform the intentional killing of a child *in utero* into healthcare, regardless of their preferred labels.

## CONCLUSION

*Amici* believe this lawsuit is a transparent attempt by an ideological government agency to collaterally attack laws

which protect women like *Amici*, from making a decision that caused them permanent injury and their children death.

If the DOJ, or any pregnant Idaho woman, believes that the Idaho abortion prohibition is unconstitutional, they should make that argument in a facial challenge to Idaho's laws. *Amici* believe the laws are valid:

These legitimate interests [in limiting abortion] include respect for and preservation of prenatal life at all stages of development; the protection of maternal health and safety; the elimination of particularly gruesome or barbaric medical procedures; the preservation of the integrity of the medical profession; the mitigation of fetal pain; and the prevention of discrimination on the basis of race, sex, or disability.

*Dobbs v. Jackson Women's Health Org.*, 597 U.S. 215, 301 (2022) (internal citation omitted).

Respectfully Submitted,

/s/ Nathan Seltzer

NATHAN T. SELTZER

*Counsel of Record for Amici Curiae*  
THE JUSTICE FOUNDATION  
8023 Vantage Dr., Suite 1275  
San Antonio, TX 78230  
(210) 614-7157  
[nseltzer@thejusticefoundation.org](mailto:nseltzer@thejusticefoundation.org)

**APPENDIX TABLE OF CONTENTS**

APPENDIX TABLE OF CONTENTS..... i  
APPENDIX 1  
Names of 2,739 Amici Women Hurt by Abortion .....App. 1

## APPENDIX 1

### Names of 2,739 Amici Women Hurt by Abortion

#### Operation Outcry Advisory Committee

Cindy Collins, Molly S. White, Luana Stoltenberg, Joyce Zounis-Brown, Millie Lace, Tracy Reynolds, Myra Jean Myers, Sue Justice, Cecilia Sullivan

#### Alaska

Victoria Faber; Jannis L. DeLand; Helen Olson; Sherry Wright; Diane Szurleys; Melanie; Cyndi Saunders; C.H.; Marsha George; L.D.; Lisa Wolske; Nancy Bienvenue; Samantha Alexander; C.F.

#### Alabama

Jamie Casey; K.H.; Donna Barham; P.S.B.; Mary Fainn; Cynthia M. Adams; Amanda Brooks; Tijuanna Adentunji; Judith Allen; G.B.; Cynthia Cameron; Karen Douglas; D.G.; Lynette Gayle; J.G.; Doris; Olivia J. Jones; Susan Kelley; Tammy Klimek; V.M.; Natalie G. Murphy; Kathy; Heather Payne; Donna J. Perry; Misty; J.P.; Faith A. Seawright; Twyla; Chanda Smiley; K.S.; Kitty Tilson; D.W.; Yonna



Williams; L.D.W.; Debbi Carlson; Felicia; Mandy Henderson;  
Deborah; Amy McLeod; L.M.; Karin Dawley; J.J.; R.L.;  
M.L.O.; Cheryl Hall; Tina; Dortha Higgins; Melody Pipkin;  
N.W.; Lee Matthews; Vickie Jackson; Cheryle; Holly Peacock;  
Mildred Ploss; Clara Morrison; Bobbie; Michelle; Sue; Wanda  
Couch; C.E.; Susan; Jennifer Ingram; Rita Wise; Karen  
Matthews; Myra Hammond; L.R.; Leslie Davis; Cindy  
Harless; D.G.; Jennifer; Lucille Patrick; Cynthia

**Arkansas**

Denise; Adrean; Melissa Swatloski; Carol Owens Vaughn;  
Crystal Roden; Shatina Logan; Morgan; Darlene Reavis;  
Linda Jackson; J.H.; Maria Pistole; Dickie Ann Lashlee; Kari  
Hodges; Lisa Nunley; Susan; Barbara Chambers; A.H.; Kristi  
Hays; Paulette Bunting; Kellie Eaton; L.G.; Sandra Marin;  
Rita; J.C.; Brooklyn; Brittany Mariner

**Arizona**

K.C.; Ruth G. Allenbach; Cathy Byrd; A.K.C.; E.M.; Gina;  
Deanna Eking; Jennifer Brannon; Andrea Christine Perez;  
M.B.; Carolyn Roberts; Jessica; P.A.; Dana Vasquez; S.B.;

Terry; Lynn; Kathy; L.L.; C.H.; Loretta; Jillian; Karen  
Mackean; C.J.; Barbara; Stephanie; Laura; Susan Palm;  
Sandra Scott; Felicia Leija; Carolyn; Monica Jordan; Trish  
Shroyer; Rita Vehon; Kriston Delhommer; Gina Dwyer;  
Deborah; S.B.K.; Judi Mountjoy; Kerri Swiniuch; F.A.;  
Christina; Jasmine Cruz; Donette Fox; Pam Lanham; Carol;  
Cindy Seipel; Sandra; Yvonne Morris; Cynthia Chinn;  
Tamara; Lisa; Joy; Cassandra; Minda Martine; Barbara  
Miller; Linette Hollyfield; Renee Villani; Margaret Cavolina;  
Mayen Handy; Patricia Palmer; Gina Kent; Sally Swanson;  
S.T.; Kerri; A.E.S.; Mary Anne Sambo; Julia Suzanne Clark

**California**

Deborah Stinson; L.P.; Jennifer Serban; Helen; Jennifer  
Bonilla; Bianca; C.C.; Barbara Lynn Cox; Glenda Day; Tanya;  
Ethel Gardver; Shelly; BJH; Carrie; Danette Nadie Martin;  
B.M.; Fallon R. Phillips; Harriett Faye Reese; Christy Torres;  
Hanya Wren Townes; Darlene Turner; Marg; Laurie Wright;  
Racheal Yard; L.Y.; Michelle; Lisa; J.B.; Loretta Soto;  
Virginia; Jeannie Seanor; Janice Clearly; T.G.; Kathy O'Shea;

A.T.; C.M.S.; Vickie Munoz; L.C.; Patricia Camper; Sandra West; S.N.; L.B.; C.R.; M.A.; Lisa; V.; Lisa Zavitka; Taylor Orona; Kristin Walters; Valerie Robins; S.M.; Christine Peterson; Christine Mabery; Susan Page; Tammy Mendoza; Shadia; L.K.; Charlene Hoyer; Elizabeth; Samita Sigala; Marjorie DiCarlo; Joyce Crommett; Diana Slumskie; Bonnie Levorson; Maralyn Smith; M.O.; Marie Knapp; Beverly Williams; N.R.; Stacy Massey; Sylvia Chaffee; Rebecca; Sheri Del Core; Mary; D.L.; Christl Siller; Angela Sisneroz; Dana Watson; Theresa Dill; Lilly Simmons; Deborah Cross; Sunny; S.J.P.; Kathleen White; Jaqueline; Dorothy Lampi; M.B.; Gail Levin; GapHyun Oh; S.W.; K.S.; Michelle Ciotta; Chrissy Helmer; Debbie Pennington; Gina Bartok; F.O.; Ammery Philebar; Beverly Cayubit; Nora Navarro-Smith; Paula Pearce; Cindy Silva; Janice Jackson; S.J.; Kamala Dyer; Consuelo Shurtleff; Patricia Byrne; Patty; A.C.; Sandy; Sonja Bates; Donna; Terri Blackburn; Jennifer Trier; Kelley; Vanessa Yagliniski; Heather Sparks; Jaclyn LaBarbera; Leslie Brunolli; Bethany Greenleaf-Perez; Paullette Williams; Dusty

Ward; Maureen; Sarah Walker; Bonnie Alvarado; Michelle Bachini; Natalie; Jennifer Kapur; C.P.; Barbara; R.C.; Christiana Brotherton; Ruthann Doyle; S.B.; D.L.; Randi Loill; L.M.; Sonia Freeman; K.A.; Nancy; Barbara Riggs; Heather Rivera; Julie; Carolyn; J.C.; Korl Peterson; P.P.; Victoria; Catherine Avenel; Cyndy Melnyk; M.B.; Elie; M.A.; M.D.; Patti Smith; L.A.; V.M.; J.F.; Lisa; K.D.; Jennifer; C.K.; Angie; A.B.; Lorraine; D.B.; C.K.; T.M.; Debbie; P.M.; Susan Denessen; M.E.; Jeanne Scott; C.P.; D.S.; Christine; E.H.; Lauren Metcalf; Rachele Flores; M.W.; C.B.; Y.C.; Diana DePriest; Monique; Elizabeth; Maricela Contreras; Judy Bowles; M.H.; June; Jessica Green; Janis; Lorraine Johnson; Sylvia Nickelson; Roberta; Kathy Hearn; Karin Gorton; G.B.; Denise; Carlene Pearson; Cindy Broese Van Groenou; Karen Cooper; Tracee Metten; Pamela Malchow; K.M.; Iris; Debbie Woods; Merlyn Cruz; Barabara Hume; H.H.; Sarah; Luisa Casados; Nicki Swendeman; Tanya Flores; Jane Suchner; Sharon; Donna Warford; B.R.; V.J.; Patricia Camper; Pamela Berry; Jennifer Woerner; D.R.; S.R.; Regina Chavarria;

Diana; Linda Barnes; Elie; Tonja; Kimberley Seward; Vickie Edwards; Keri Newton; Sharon; Joanna; Karin Gorton; Andrea Finch; Paula Johnson; Mary Lou Rodriguez; Sally Jacobus; Maureen; Denise Keiser; A.K.; Z.N.; Michelle Greco; Cassandra; S.S.; Naomi Killough; Margo; Kathy Jones; C.T.; O.C.; Dolores; Cassandra Rinnert; Diana; Grace Nicholaou; Marcela Owens; Kelli Bagnall; Mary Olson; L.H.; Valerie Hill; J.; Ellen; C.; C.M.S.; Antoinette; Elaine Fleming

**Colorado**

Mary Cowan; Susan Ritter; Candace Thompson; L.H.; Tricia; Donna Koch; Mary Ann Broussard; Cynthia; O.M.; H.M.; Scot; Leah Vandersluis; Diane Sillstrop; Regina Cook; Rachel Tagliente; Kendra Watson; Mary Ann Mueller; Kristina; Lisa Koets; Holly; Cindy Schneider; Judy Fosburgh; L.M.; Abby Corrigan; Kathleen; R.S.; L.O.; Tiffany Stuart; Heather O'Leary; M.W.; S.H.; Kimberly Orr; J.G.; Tammy; Dawn; B.V.G.; Lisa Koets; M.W.; R.B.; Patricia Toon; Cheryl; M.H.; Ronda; Dwan Rager; Susan; Vancellen Ravensberg; Marlene Murray; Jane; Jill Norman; Connie; K.S.; Christine;

Catherine; A.S.; Barbara Kaper; Susan Karbach; Sandy;  
Pamela Free; Barbara Allen; K.D.; Cindy; R.H.; Lisa Jones;  
Becky Wade; Martha Huber; Carrie Fulton; T.C.; LuAnn  
Morton-Earl Blueheart; K.J.

**Connecticut**

Leslie Chambers; Nilza Laureano-Carrion; Deborah;  
Sherri Lafferty; Christine; Joan; Carol Bracken; Katherine  
Callaghan-Fenton; Jennifer Bennett; N.Y.; Sharon Bente;  
Joanne Alexander; Denise; E.J.; Kate; Suzanne; Patricia  
Spruance; Pati Adams; Kathryn Geary

**District of Columbia**

Jeri; B.J; Melissa Hemphill

**Delaware**

Teresa Bolden; Colleen Cooper; Hilary Meagan Taylor;  
Lisa Doak; C.L.; C.S.; Tina; Jessica; Carmen

**Florida**

Emily; Lynnsey; Karen Agnew; Zorica; Lisa; Angela  
Bornstein; Susan Brasher; Chrystal Bridgeman; Linda  
Bukowy; Susan Burke; Rachel Caruso; Rachel Catalan;

Barbara; Maria Angelica Correa; K.D.; Rhonda; Bianca  
Devilme; D.L.D.; S.E.; Bette Etoll; Debra Ferguson; Carol A.  
Gonterman; Kirsten; Karen L. Gushta; Lovana Marie  
Howard; Suzanne Howard; Vicki Hudson; Suzanne Killion;  
Susan; Audry M. Lane; Tamara S. Megee; Claudia; Jennifer  
Morales; Sheri More; Linda; Sandra Neal; J.N.; Lois Ocampo;  
Tracy Okus; Maureen O.; Elizabeth Phelps; Rebecca Porter;  
Michelle; R.A.P.; Erin; Sylvette D. Rivera-Eliza; Kathleen  
Robinson; J.M.R.; P.R.; Camelita Skeete; Karen Snyder;  
Sally; Kristen Staehler; Theresa A. Taylor; Jessica; Kathleen  
Williams; Theresa M. Wyman; Linda; Christine Williams;  
Amarilys Suarez; Muriel Ramos; Kerry Black; Leanne  
Kaplan; Valerie; P.B.; Valerie McCoy; N.M.; Sara Flynn;  
Kathleen Weissinger; Judith Ewaldt; Carole Hayes; J.M.K.;  
Loretta Judy; Sharon; Sonia Velasquez; D.R.; Leann; Denise  
Mixson; Arleen Elias; Kathelen; Debbie; Viviane; Amanda  
Lee; Patricia; Heidi Messina; Karen Leone; Lynne Davis; S.B.;  
Krista; G.N.; Tamsyn Logan; Sonja Lonadier; Cherie; Jen  
Drake; Teresa; T.W.; Jamie Williams; Cynthia Williamson;

Linda Van Wey; Ashley Koubek; Melissa; Linda Tholl; Traci Licht; L.T.; Lupe; Mildred Gonzalez; J.W.; Teresa O'Brian; Janet Darrah; Judy Langston; Joan Giakoumis; Suzanne Edens; Tara Bounds; Bonnie; Jana; Marcia McNaney; Angel Hill; Jenny; Elizabeth Gamble; Marion; Daria Monroe; Cherie Anderson; Pam; Heather Chaddock; Mollie; Helen Upton; Denise Lewis; Cheryl; April; Edith Ugarte; June Heitzman; Julie; Billie Jo Carney; Spring Malone; M.P.; Wanda Febo; Sarah Eaton; C.A.; Jennifer; Lesley May; Renee Pechonis; J.M.C.; Jaime; Dee; N.W.; Mandi Massenburg; Sharon May; Cheryl Carey; Jeanne Pernia; Lisa Rist; N.L.; S.M.; E.W.; Catherine; Lucinda Fasig; Lisa; M.B.; Kathleen Weissinger; M.A.; Kristi; C.K.; Maura Lanz; Robin Squillante; Mildred Gonzalez; Myrtle; M.A.C.; Margo; Silvana; Rebecca Cyphers; Barbara Randolph; Sharon; M.M.; C.C.; D.L.; Gina; Carol Barry; Carol Thomas; Deborah Borges; Constance; D.D.; Vikki Ameault; Tracy Robertson; M.O.; D.P.; S.T.; Kristy; Brenda; Sarah; Linda; Cheri; M.H.; Deborah Le Blanc; Simone Taylor; Elaine; P.J.; Rhonda Cruz; Donna; Melissa



Mason; Tangie Jeffrey; Diane Bright; Theresa Taylor;  
Kristine Peters; Gena Duran; M.S.; T.M.; Mary MacMillam;  
Luz Marina Tamayo; Ana Lopez; Sharon Herrington; Claudia;  
S.F.; Marjorie Hayes; Karina Strong; Heather Goldin; Alyssa  
Mayberry; Jennifer Kittredge; Sharon Baumgartner; Lynnsey  
Bailey; June Heitzman; Winnifred Bell; Denise Hansbury;  
N.L.; Lois Angela Wood; Lynn; Melody Roseberry; Laura  
Slaback; M.B.; Sally Nealy; Mary Guthrie; Melissa Brusoe;  
A.W.; D.P.H.; Michelle Geraci; R.M.; Stella King; Patti; Y.M.;  
Alicia Thompson; Melody Ashley; Kaylania Chapman;  
Loretta; Deborah L. Bryan; Ann Berglund; D.L.J.; Barbara  
Richards; Elizabeth; Victoria Barber; Stephanie Jacobson;  
Mary Beth Haug

**Georgia**

Carrie Sanchez; Colleen Walters; R.B.; Brennan Bradford;  
Leigh; Deborah Flowers; Betty B. Mallermen; Marie Smith;  
M.; Rebecca Tribble; Lee Trott; Louise Webb; Crystal Wilson;  
Karen Franzen; B.W.; Katherine Adinolfi; Kimberly Stark;  
Delia Cooper; A.N.; Rebecca Reisinger; Diana; Pamela

Robbins; Rachael Sidwell; Marcia Gray; L.W.; J.T.; C.G.; C.R.;  
Yolanda; Rosalie; Sandra; Darlene; Annette Ciaravino;  
Shannon; Jackie; Lisa; S.M.; Theresa Hughes; Cynthia  
Marvin-Richard; Debra Civetta; S.B.; Stephanie Sparks;  
Regina Davidson; D.M.; Charlotte Smith; Michele; Gema  
Bass; Melanie Carter; Holly Whitehead; Donna Hauntsman;  
Kim; Susan Bennett; Barbara Higgins; Deidra Paulk; Teri  
Bradberry; B.P.; R.C.; Sandra; Jeanne Pernia; Patricia Lea;  
Sherri Nelson; Margaret; Gina Hartley; Sonya Howard;  
Cindy; Julia; Helanie Tresidder; Angela Home; J.F.; D.D.;  
Susanne; Christine Maynard; G.L.L.; M.B.; Monika Woods;  
Patty; Cristina; Z.R.; P.P.; B.; Karen; L.B.; Gloria Kite; Kim;  
Katie Rowell; Louise; Margaret; Mary Jean Roberts; U.B.;  
V.W.; Jae Duffy; V.M.; Marcia; A.G.; Holly; Kathryn Siegel;  
Karen Downing; Kelli Combs; Cindy Wright; B.O.; Cheryl  
Jackson; Terri; Deborah Carter; Kerri Parson; Julie Bugg;  
J.C.; I.R.; Tonya Dodson; T.E.; Maria Rice; L.A.; Liz; Patricia;  
Nancy Fabbri; Cindy; G.M.; Michele Cheresnick; A.R.H.;  
Jama Ann Cagle; Deborah Rutherford; L.H.; Shirley Zambino

**Hawaii**

Rebecca Kikugawa; A.W.; Janet Eisenbach; Sacha Ferguson; Carrie Ehr Gott; Jennifer Adcock; Marybeth; Alida White; Audrey; Kim Downham; Loreene Akamine; M.W.; Leonora

**Iowa**

Cynthia Korn; Pam Luders; Renee Marie Boland; Angela Wyatt; Julie; Darcy Dvorak; S.R.; Susan Heinle; Shawn Lohry; C.K; Carrie Pauley; Erin Brandt; Candace Davis; Becky Menke; C.S.; Deaun Zasadny; Donna; Suzanne Hall; N.M.; Jocelyn Fry; Victoria Sachleben; Mary; Monica Clarke

**Idaho**

Terri Wright; Amanda; Aishaq Mefford; Kelly Antonczak; L.B.; Danette; J.W.; Virginia

**Illinois**

Karen Sue Anderson; P.; Joy Martin; Kelly Shane; M.H.; Jacqueline Conrad; K.C.; Julie Holland; B.R.; Linda Couri; Narda Rothermel; Rhonda Clark; Ann Penney; JodiLynn Pautz; Dawn; Diane Rittenberry; Lianne; Jody Aldridge;

Linda Neill; Debra Birkhead; Joely Forte; Wendy Morrow;  
Gloria; Tonia Cohoon; Deb; A.S.; T.W.; J.K.H.; V.N.; Judy  
Dasse Stott; V.B.; J.R.; Judy; Pam; Anette Rodriguez; M.O.;  
Jean; C.F.; Christie Duffy; Phyllis; Crystal; Cathy  
Trowbridge; Jean Nance; R.T.; Barbara; Shannon Dunn;  
Sarah; Carol Rybacki; Beth Lizano; Amina Rivera; Kathy  
Ellis

**Indiana**

Marcy; Beth DaCosta; Melanie; Dena; M.H.; Barbara;  
Elizabeth Kane; Marti Lane; Melanie P.; L.W.; K.L.W.; Eve  
Johnson; Amy Wantz; P.C.; Kim Barnett; Bonita; Cathy; B.R.;  
Janet Givens; Andrea; Aimee Gill; Shanna; A.A.; Holly  
Maxwell; Fran; Heidi Wheeler; Diann Canapa; L.S.T.; Jeanna  
Romein; Krista; S.H.; Lisa; Sarah; Brandi; Iris Wright; Linda  
Thomas; Marsha Yeary; Linda Sargent; Christine  
Harrington; Leslie Kraus; Aimee Gill; Ronda Stralton; Peg;  
Joyce Howard; Sandra; Stacy Wright; Shannon Hoy; R.M.;  
Rebekah Carpenter; Linda Crawley; Rhonda Smith; Julie  
McMillan; Leandrea; C.K.; B.C.; Rakisha Davis; Christine

Bullock; Virginia Mahoney; T.B.; Phyllis; Sarah; Tami  
Mohler; Kayc Mykrantz; Serena Dyksen

**Kansas**

Katrene Bormann; Amy Meyer; Deborah A. Ruby-Phillips;  
D.Kohl; Yvonne; A.K. LaVeta Wheeler; Q.M.; Kathryn  
Washburn; Karen; Carol; Marcia; Tina; G.H.; Jean; V.S.;  
Anne; J.O.; Christine; B.M.; Stephanie Thomas; Theresa  
McCrackine; C.R.; Nancy; Kathy; Linda; Amanda; Wendi  
Unrein; K.T.; Erin; Lindsay; Lori Williams; Kristi; D.; Lynn  
Schrepfer

**Kentucky**

Lisa; Sandra Mayfield; Denise Nash; Kaitlyn MacMillan;  
Victoria; Bobbye Blackburn; Glenda Capps; Pamela Brown;  
S.F.; Bridget Richardson; Terri; J.J.; Brenda Fogle; Susan;  
Angela; Anna; Deidre Edwards; Lisa; Vicki; Debbie Ellis; J.D.;  
Rebecca Barnes; Melinda; Virginia; Heidi Reihing; Melanie;  
Deanna; Sherry; Catherine New; Donna; Connie Sylvester;  
Rayna; S.M.

**Louisiana**

Kathleen O'Donnell; Amanda Clark; Suellen; Jennifer; Ava  
Petermann Bertrand; Audrey Lynne Reed; Robin Robinson;  
Tracy Schmidt; S.K.; Cynthia Labutka; Joyce; Shannon  
Murdock; Veronica; Carol; Jeanine; Tina Fontenot; E.P.;  
Brandi; S.T.; Stephanie; Michelle Durand; Jan Pitts; Tammy;  
Kay Murphy; Susan; I.G.; T.C.; Marie; Diane Tate; Catherine  
Husband; Roni; Sharon; Mandi Ponce; Karen Bock; Brittany  
Guillory; Jeanine McAndrew Holmes; Kerri; C.K.; S.S.; C.R.;  
Laura Carrion; Melinda Franz; Marcia Schexnider; Mary  
Pappion; Erin Pleune; Tina Lord Beasley; Robin Becnel; S.O.

**Massachusetts**

Kathleen; Monica; Lisa; Madeline Fiorino; Grace Ann  
Haggerty; M.F.; Sharon Lynch; Lori Tanner; Theresa Green;  
Kathleen Stepherson; Gwendolyn D'Aguiar; Denise Merullo;  
K.B.; Lisa Pugh; Janet; Linda Stanley; M.K.; Mary Beth  
Fiume Freddo; B.F.; Diane

**Maryland**

Diana Perito; Denise Douglas; Teresa Kampmeyer; J.A.;  
Cindy Riley; Nina; Jessica; Melissa Garman; E.F.; C.P.; Sue;

Maria Grace; E.K.; Colleen Copeland; A.B.; Jill; Jennifer;  
Linda; Meredith; Karen King; N.E.; Bonnie Bass; Honorine

**Maine**

Sherry Stine; Theresa; Angel Murchinson; Suzzanne; D.P.;  
Laurie; Susan Rowland; Leslie Sneddon

**Michigan**

Jacqueline Coal; Karen Sue Gentile; J.H.; Karen Holdren;  
Debra Johnson; J.M.; Lori Pennington; Laura Rodriguez;  
Karen Waldo; Barbara Lee; Ellen Beshada; LuAnn Phillips;  
Agtnese Raffaelli; D.B.; Della Seeley; Amy; Tami Fioranelli;  
J.H.; Deborah Sidelinker; Tammy; Tara; Terena Lawson;  
Judy Hill; Christin Rutkey; A.D.; Kathryn Sieloff; Kathryn  
Beckwith; Shari; Kimberly; K.J.; M.K.G.; Loretta Curtis;  
K.U.; Bonnie; Catherine; Christine; K.R.; J.B.; Renee; Deanna  
Wood; Barbara Yagley; Connie Mossner; Laura LeBlanc;  
Denise; JudeAnn; Sheila Sibilsky; Patricia; M.C.; Jenny;  
Anne; Nancy Zook; Rochelle Beckemeyer; Sandy; Eileen  
Craig; Jaimie Skalski; Deann Oliver; Teresa Hathaway;  
Sharleen Richard; Julia

**Minnesota**

Hannah Murphy; Julie; Becky Boyer; Catherine Goggin;  
Shelly Stone; Julia Bashore; Joyce Olson-Baer; Debra  
Brunsberg; Stephanie; Kristen Frank; Joy; B.P.; Lucinda;  
Linda Prok; Mary Norgren; Christina Soleta; Judy  
Rademacher; A.M.; Patricia Moncrief; L.W.; Deb; Michelle;  
Deanna Carlson; Lisa; Janet; L.M.; B.D.; Heidi Magness; S.B.;  
Laura Anderson; LeNae Williamson; Charlene Simon-Hunt

**Missouri**

Elizabeth; Pearl; Connie Eller; Julie Call; Chris; Janene  
Perillo; K.R.; Karen Vagooni; Jeannie Weston; Sherry; Mary  
Hargadine; Natalie Opperman; Jeanie; Sonya; Karen; Kathy  
Pittman; Cheryl DeLany; Joyce Cowan; K.S.C.; S.B.; L.R.;  
Christine Puetz; C.L.; S.T.; Holly; P.B.; Darla; Shellie Ligon;  
Nicole Trujillo; Tabatha; Marisol Pfaff; Erika; Georgia; Toni;  
B.L.; A.F.; Jennifer Chrisman; Fay Gilson; L.R.K.; D.L.;  
Denise; Vickie Kerchner; Sarah Krieg; Sheri; Carolyn; Judi;  
Cheryl Castor; Christine Puetz; Dana Wilson; Rebecca  
Hipkins; Erma; M.B.; S.L.; V.; Janice Post; Tracy Lustick;



Lori; Lisa J. Bickel Stribling; Heather Shatswell; Glenda;  
Tanya; Michelle; Kayla McDaniel; M.W.; Brenda Redman;  
Elena; Marilyn Cox; Lisa Mahiger; Debra Nelson; Jane; Lisa  
Mahiger; Dorothy Jubinville; B.B.; Kiwanis Howard; Kelly;  
Gretchen Boyer; Marie Wakefield; R.B.; Maria Thompson;  
D.S.; K.F.

**Mississippi**

Alfreda; Sharon; K.B.; T.S.; C.S.; M.B.; Nita Balsley; D.K.;  
Sonia; Amanda Orick; C.N.; Susanne; Melissa Champine;  
Tammy Gaede; Dianna Wolfe; Ann Reed; P.C.; V.W.; S.R.;  
S.D.; C.S.; Catherine; Cheryl Hourguettes; Deborah; A.D.

**Montana**

Stephanie Allestad; Lisa; N.K.; Laura Middleton; Dawn;  
Megan Petty; Linda Hoenigsberg; Joni Lineberry; Rashel  
Brown; Tarah Oldroyd

**North Carolina**

Amy Fabelle Shoup; Susan; T.D.B.; Jill K. Cooper; Donna  
B. Fields; Beverly V.Hall; Debra; Julia Newman Finch; Jo;  
Sue Madden; Tara J.Quinn; Teresa; Cheryl; Shelley Glanton;

Donda Toney; Yasmine Howerton; Kathryn Berkowitz;  
Victoria Koloff; Nina Hocutt; Joan Haselman; Brenda  
Forester; Debbie Martindale; Gwen Smith; Selena; P.B.; Jane  
Thomas; Regina; C.C.; Mary Coffey; Charlene; Michelle;  
Nicole Churchill-Lowman; Annie Perry; JoHana Traughber;  
Jaimie; J.S.; Jennifer Felts; Regina Priester; Mary  
Froneberger; Debbie Weaver; Jill; Patricia Brogdon; Cindy  
Garner; Donna Ginn; Charlene Eason; Susan Vanderberg;  
Deanna Falhook; Marsha; Julie Ann Cobb; Stacey Pinkham;  
Lisa; Desirae Burton; Jill; Lynn; S.H.; Dale A. Perrine; Terri;  
Samantha Dalrymple; Kristi Craig; Monica; Beth; Jennifer  
Simmons; Andrea Chamberlain; Sandra; M.K.; T.C.; Mary  
Sue Glazier; Sandra Gleason; Kim; B.L.; Barnanne; C.J.;  
Kimberly; J.L.; Jamie; Kimberly Smith; Mary Jane; D.R.;  
Patricia Johnson-Velez; Laura; Laura Box; O.P.; M.P.P.; Jill  
McMahon; J.O.; Luana; Mary Snead; Cheryl; April Elkins;  
Suzanne Lawrence; Toni Buckler; Lizbeth Hall; Tammy  
Litchfield; Jessica Faber; Suzy; Shana Gordy; Carol; Jade  
Delapouyade; Alicia Watts; I.R.; K.G.; V.; Lisa; Denise Stroup;

Claudia; Yvonne; Pam; Robyn; Donna Grisham; Becky  
Jorgenson

**North Dakota**

Jody Clemens; M.S.; C.M.; K.W.S.

**Nebraska**

Ina Glenn; Karen; Joane; Lisa Schultis; Deborah  
Broussard; Cheryl; K.M.; J.L.; F.S.; Kathleen Manley; Jill  
Lamson Gran; Francine Aragon; Peggy J. Orr; Melissa

**New Hampshire**

J.M.B.; Irene Lagios; Starr; C.A.; Diane; Jennifer; Dianne;  
Patricia Reed

**New Jersey**

Vanessa McCauley; E.A.; Sarah Delgado; Lescena Minn;  
Anita Bagnall; Gloria; Tara Sparano; Trudy; Laurie; Jennifer  
Passarelli; Kathleen; D.V.; Cindy Giaquinto; J.V.; Michelle;  
Ann; Kendra Gorzynski; E.A.; Alana; Shelly Christine Ristow;  
Kerri; Ethel Hermenau; Gail Scandell; M.W.; Jennifer;  
Caroline Medina; Sandra Buchanan; Mary MacNeill; Ella

Blair Newcomb Redshirt; Alfreda Baker; Joan Vitale; Marie;  
Kerri; Kim; Margaret

**New Mexico**

C.B.; Andrea Gordon; Dale M. Haaf; T.F.; Karen; A.W.;  
Angela; D.K.C.; Janet; Meagan; Lori; T.C.; A.H.; Deborah  
Wilbourn; Joanne Muniz; Aundrea Connolly; Tracy Gorenz;  
B.R.; Georgianne; Susan Swafford; Dianne; Laura LeFevre;  
Michelle Beglau; K.E.; D.C.; Lauren Dumale

**Nevada**

Amanda Scilacci; Shirley Smith; M.S.; Angel Nugent;  
Mildred Schultz; Stephanie; Jacqueline; Paige; Theresa Cobb;  
Sally; Malinda; A.T.; Sylvia; C.K.; Katherine Clemons; K.P.;  
Kit Sober; Darlene Gaston; Anna Serra-Radford; Doria Zeiter;  
Sacha Ferguson; Kelly Vargas

**New York**

M.S.; Suzanne Topping; Katherine Clyde; M.P.; Brenda;  
D.D.; L.M.; R.R.; Damaris Cruz; Vicki; Barb; P.D.; Donna  
Vassilatos; J.P.; Annette; J.D.; Bonnie DiGeronimo; Jamealy  
Flammer; T.J.; Kerry Starng; Rebecca Lee; Maria

DiTommaso; Kehinde Moodie; Cristin Vileria; Toni Feinman;  
Patricia Young; Dorina Hayes; D.W.; Leslie; Joetta  
Cinquemani; Maria Rice; Kelley Craver; Kathy; Donna; P.R.;  
Denise; C.M.; Beth; Theresa; Barbara Bott; Linda DiFiore;  
K.T.; Cherri; J.H.; P.H.; Alena Radtke-Gabriel; Maria Ortiz  
Wuster; S.C.; Ebi Ogbu; Mary Beth Miller; Veronica D'Angelo;  
E.M.; P.L.; L.M.; K.C.; Kathleen Cosgrove; Joni D. Doymich;  
C.G.; E.; C.B.M.; Lorraine Welch; T.B.; Saabira Ali; Marisol  
Pardo; Jessi Darvill; Mary Ellen Hancock; V.C.; Mary;  
Christine Bridges; Nancy Belzile; Carolyn; Joy Gossett Leach;  
Kathleen; Deborah Garsik; Nicole

**Ohio**

Christina Singletary- Nkounkou; Amber; Holly Haas;  
Ashley; D.C.; Karen; M.M.; Janie; Emma; D.M.; S.K.; J.G.;  
Marlene; M.S.; Christi Hall; Anna Jacobs; M.A.; Melissa  
Leibold; Gail Bersch; Margot Fuller; Linda Lamb; Melissa  
Morris; Jodie Horn; Fern Buzinski; Nicole; Christina Stout;  
Janet Williams; Pam; Lisa; Stacy Boyd; Jane Pennington;  
Holly Cart; Jill Kish; Cynthia Caillouet; W.L.B.; Nicole;

Pamela; Melody; P.S.J.M.; Anita Manninen; Mandy; Tammy  
Jones; Cynthia; Colleen; Susan Pfarr; Shanna Samples;  
Kathy Mitchell; A.G.; Shelly Holt; Rachelle Heidlebaugh;  
Susan; Sandra; Kathryn Bretz; Shannon McGuire; Deborah;  
L.G.; Denise Brown; J.D.; Kristina Davis; Corrine J. Fletcher;  
LeeAnne Freddo; Lori; J.S.; Chrissy Jen Wieters; Gina Shives;  
Krista Willertz; Bianca; C.E.; R.C.; Samantha; Susan Price;  
Sherin Thurman; Theresa

**Oklahoma**

Angela Moreno; Christine Monteith; Cindy King; Sherrie;  
Kelly Stout; J.C.; K.J.; Karen Linton; Linda Caswell; Melissa;  
Carol; Angela; Cris Kurtz; Linda; Vickie Edwards; Patricia  
Perkins; Karen; Evelyn; C.M.; M.W.; Renee; Vicki Lott; Linda  
Stocker; S.W.; Jana Journeay; Melissa Wheeler; L.P.; Kalye;  
Shannon

**Oregon**

Gail Holmes; Deborah Mace; S.C.; D.G.; Jennifer  
Candianides; Sharon; Karen Hopman; Tracy; Vivian Ward;  
Jeanne Berry; Nancy Bailey; P.R.; Skye; Susan; Eileen;

Kristal Talaski; Yvonne Mutch; Teresa Ortiz; Lavonne Pennington; Sandy Loftus; Melissa Marshall; Holly; Rachel Ann Kingston; Darcy; Dianne Kirkwood; Michelle; Kim; Jean; Anne; Linda Bishop; Janice Carleton; Debbie; T.M.; Jo Lisa Blossom; Lea McKnight; Lynda; L.N.; Patricia LaRue; Patricia; Deborah Martin; Debbie Marshall; Sharon Blankenship; Eileen Hall; Cynthia Miller; Lisa Learn; S.J.; Robyn; Joanna Szrama; Elizabeth Gillette; F.G.

**Pennsylvania**

A.D.; Susan Dule; Angela Gray; Kati; Dawn; Heather Muncy; Jaime Hilton; Diana Harlan Wells; Tricia Thomas; Jacqueline; Barbara Ratliff; H.P.; C.S.; Candace Pavese; Yvonne; Mary; Cynthia Bagwell; Tanya Morris; Karmen Kennedy; Sharon; V.P., Kimberly; R.M.; Tiffany Wissinger; Christine McCauley; Catherine; Dawn; M.H.; Betty Jo Geyer; Lisa Williams; Carla Ezell; S.F.; Janis; H.R.K.; T.T.; L.M.; M.F.; Louise Gialanella; Bonnie; Debra; Robin; Denise Teirney; M.G.; Kathy Raudabaugh; Melanie Fleming; Shay; Theresa Baux; Miriam Mitten; S.N.; Kristen Antonioli;

Danielle; Annette; Barbara; Cheryl; E.M.E.; Kelly A. Good;  
M.L.Kane; Jennifer; Diane; Kristine M. Meyer; Karen; Janice;  
Sonya Lacy; Jeri Kamertz; Melissa; Deborah; LaVonne  
Ackerman; M.D.; M.G.; Cheryl; Theresa Shiller; Victoria  
Kilroy; A.B.; Shirley Markle; Joan I. Ostrowski

**Rhode Island**

Wilma Sanchez; Janette; Lesli; Mary Lynch; Mary  
Langford; Kristin Caproni

**South Carolina**

Connie Gay Ellertsson; Taylor; Deborah Patterson;  
Carolyn Rice; Linda Wentz; Cheryl Robinson; C.H.; Tamela  
Maxim; C.S.R.; L.H.; T.K.; Ginger Canipe; R.W.; Sandra L.  
Trasport; Wendy; Janet; Maureen; Jerri Bancroft; Yvonne  
Rivera; Deborah Wood; Stephanie Cole; Frances Allen;  
Cynthia Blackwell; Sandra Kirk; Nancy Borrett; Pam Caymol  
Badger; J.K.; T.M.; Lynda Doty; Susan Okun; A.M.; C.B.;  
G.T.; Kelly Parr; Jennifer; T.H.; C.S.; Reyna Cordero; Rachel;  
Golda Dunn; Monica; Rhonda Onisto; Shirley; Jane Ford;  
Marcie Walls; Jane Sanders; Lori; Christina Barnes; Frances



Carrasquillo; Casey Ruppe; Indu; Makenzie; Caryn; Jane  
Anderson; Phyllis Maloni; J.D.

**South Dakota**

C.L.; L.R.; Dianne Heynen; Patty Miller; Marcee; Kim  
Houchens; Beth Douglas

**Tennessee**

Sandi Nanette Gray; Eugenia Appleman-Black; Andy;  
Teresa; Melody; Carolyn; P.M.; Penney; Cynthia; Donna  
Morton; Jennifer Miller; Karen Follis; Karen Eustice; Cindy  
Hammontree; T.H.; Susan Molitor; C.D.; Sherri Bellinger;  
Dora Escue; Lynn Jefferson; Deborah Moore; Katherine; Lisa  
Morris; Dee Ann Neely; Laurie; K.M.; T.O.; V.N.; Kody Guinn;  
Barbara; Peggy English; Judy Charest; Judy; Mary R. Hall;  
Stephanie; Teresa Dawn Sybert Tipton; Julie Shockley; Becky  
Wehrle; Betty Pannell; P.W.; Mende; Linda; A.W.; M.R.;  
Patricia A. Thomas; Janet Radford; Kathy; Barbara Wilkins;  
Ellen Philpot; Mitzi Turpin; K.S.; L.P.; Nancy; Ramona  
Stricklin; Janet; Debra; Beverly Sims; Angela Thompson;

A.F.; Amanda Lipetri; Lynn Zant; Donna Jollay; Karen Ellison

**Texas**

Maria Toribia Cooper; Jennifer; Cassandra; Elena Ancarrow; Leslie; Priscilla Balido; J.B.; Nancy; Shaina; Lisa Marie Diaz; Laura; S.D.; Nona Ellington; Grace English; Tracie Estrada; Amanda; Ashton Fisher; Nina; J.B.F.; P.R.G.; Rita Gonzalez; Shirley Lynn Gritta; Tana Hawkins; Carie Ann Heban; Maricela Irons; Amy Jackson; Karen Jeffers; Vanessa S. Jones; Alisa Jordhein; Eva Joy; Maureen; Sandra Lambert; Tonya Lawson; Janet Lemelle; Dawn Maples; Janet; DeeAnn McDonald; L.M.; Tammie Neal; M.O.K.; Carol Phillips; Karen Porter; Lillie Price; Kimberly; S.R.F.; Britany Rice; Ana; Sylvia Rodriguez; Randa Gillespie Russell; Cathy; Aleyda Salinas; Theresa Schrock; Kathy Scott; Tracy Sequin; V.S.; Therese Spina; Lisa; Sylvia; Susie Taylor; Misty Timms; Jennifer Tennon; Davida Tackwood; L.T.; Kelly Vanderlinden; Sonya Weston; Patricia White; Susan Adams Wicklander; Rhonda Simmons Willis; Sheryl Young; Susan

Daugherty; Sandra Darling; Linda; Tammy Stinson; Maria Tomilson. Virginia Zamudio Lange; Erin; Lisa Lerner; Meg Valentino; Patti Parr; Wendy; Jessica Hughes; Cari Harris; Esmeralda Garza; Kimberly Reynolds; Gail Grisell; Jorea McNamee Blount; Ketra Hancock; Sharra Poteet; Vickie Adams; Maria; Andrea Christopher; Katherine Herrmann; L.B.; Keri; Angie; L.W.; Summer Cash; B.L.; Jolean; S.H.; Kristin; Joanne; Loretta; Jessica Kelly; D.J.; Diana Miller; J.T.; Betty Taylor; M.H.; R.T.; Januari Works; Linda Seibert; Marga; Mary; Diana Nash; X.K.; Suzanne; Carla Hansbro; Mary Collier; Amy; Dalila Aldrich; Wanda Gebhart; Jeri Hawkins; Teresa Carrow; Marion Lee McGlothlin; Rebecca; Alison; Stephanie Larson; Mary Guzman; P.T.; Donna; Donna; B.B.; Jackie; C.S.; Valerie; J.W.; J.R.; Elizabeth (Betty) Underwood; Rhonda Rhodes; Carrie Toering; M.V.; Melissa Getz; J.A.; M.D.; Amy Shipton; Barbi Fox; N.C.; Llana Moss; Khristina Shaw; Christi Daws; Christina; Kay Archer; M.A.E.; Rebecca Kennedy; L.C.; Jeri; E.R.; Thon; Aimee McGinnis; Jennifer; A.G.; Danna Dixon; Crystal Derrick;

Teresa; Sherre West; Jill; Elizabeth Douglas; T. Antoinette  
Wilson; Angela Ford; Julie Dinkins-Borkowski; Rolanda  
Shrader; Rebecca; Kate; Berlinda Llanes; Renee Sharper;  
L.S.; Carol Castro; Jane Hatcher; Lisa Skowron; Rande  
Snyder; Lynne; T.C.; Deanna Suarez; P.W.; K.B.; Lisa  
Anderson; Megan; Marian; Stacey; Victoria Smith; P.C.;  
Katherine Keeney; J.W.; Anne; Linda Austin; Melanie  
Morgan; Viola Morgenstern; Lisa Fallis; Margaret Rice; Amy;  
Kathryn; Crystal Hartmann; F.E.C.; M.T.; Lynn Hoyt; Bonnie  
Horn; Sandra Decker; Arcilla Richards; M.F.; Lynn; A.B.;  
Carrie; Kay Doran; Tammie; Stella Taylor; Debra; Penny;  
Beatrice; Rosalie Farmer; Janet Conway; K.D.; Mary; Shelley;  
L.P.; Celinda Frost; Nikki Waltrowski; Laura; Debra; R.D.;  
J.D.; P.S.; Kimberly; T.P.; L.M.; Thelma; Lisa Collett; R.S.;  
Beth McKee; Kellie Roenker; Nicole; Karen; Irene; Dian;  
Marsha Hayes; Rhonda Meek; D.K.; L.S.; Gale Payne; Mary;  
Leella Cherry; Betsy DiGiacinto; M.M.; Julie Enriquez;  
Laura; Dayna DeBin; Sandra Livingston; Sue Lassiter; P.O.;  
K.H.; Adrienne; Yvonne Moore; Cathy Young; Cathy Young;

Debra Marrinan; Lynn; Jennifer Samora; Dorinda Haun;  
J.E.D.; Maria Teresa Hernandez; B.P.; Mary Ann Duncan;  
M.H.; Myrna; Jill; Ruth McLemore; J.D.; Patricia Bilbo; Sarah  
Allen; Terra Wood; Janet Kunkel; Sue Ratterree; Maureen;  
Mary Cochran; Darlene Johnson Davis; Rochelle; K.R.; Misty  
Bridges; Sharon; Sharra Poteet; Mary Lee Mason; Amy Dean;  
Cindy Arbaugh; P.D.; Rachel; Cami Hill; D.P.; Claudia  
Madrid; Lelar Phoenix; Karen; S.E.; Kim Moss; Judy;  
Annette; Barbara Archer; Rosa; Lisa Chisholm; Betty  
Martinez Rivera; Debby Efurd; A.G.; Jennifer Martinez; K.M.;  
Tina; K.F.; Sandra Hernandez; R.V.; Michelle Matthews;  
R.W.; Jennifer; Christine Kasper; Tammy; Anna Jordan;  
Marlene O'Keefe; Ginny Larvin; Cheli Cook; Dion Ross; Misty  
Black; Lana Sanders; Lynne; Paula Lafleur; Kandy; Norma  
Jean Tanton; S.C.; D.A.; Becki; Ginger Resta; M.M.; T.W.;  
Charlotte Hartzell; Amanda Ford; Lisa; T.G.; Penne Logan;  
Anisa Neely; Cindy Maggiulli; Kathi Hall; Helen Dean; M.W.;  
Linda; Mitzi Atkinson; Debra; Amanda Coyle; Toni McKinley;  
Tina; S.P.; Erica; K. Sanchez; Linda Huffsteller; Cassandra

Sanders; R.C.S.; Lorrie; J.M.; Tricia Heflin; Lynne; B.B.M.;  
Susie; Shannon Stahla; Ann M. Younger; Yolanda; Karen;  
Angela Oakes; Debra Holliday; Nancy Ponce; R.H.; Teri Lloyd;  
Teresa Martinez; Vanesa; S.K.; Ellen Kirbie; Pat Simpson;  
J.M.C.; Sheila Kelsey; Sarah Martin; Heather; Amanda  
Oparanozie; Thilini Cate; Raquel Bailey; Hilda Ball; Ingrid  
Cooper; Elsa Escobedo-Lopez; Ann Birdwell; C.R.W.; Carrie  
Knelsley; Mattie; Katrin Young; Jennifer Comeaux; Tenysha  
Rael; Dora Ann Rohde; Yvonne; Gayna; Alondra; Kayla;  
Elizabeth; Cheryl G. Fawvor; Hanna Umsptead; D.G.; Paige  
Head; Kathy Walton; Mary E. Cooper; Mitzi Lux; Shanna  
Cates; Cynthia Henderson; Moriah Rivera; Brook Turner;  
Autumn; L.T.; Dawnita Taylor; Jeanne; Margarita Rosa  
Villafranca; Cristal Richardson; Michelle Geisendorff

**Utah**

Cindy Cunliffe; MeKel Engel; L.W.; Cynthia Leonard; D.C.;  
Lisa; Jennifer Daniels

**Virginia**

E.B.; S.B.; Jena L. Crispin; Nancy Louise DeBond; Sharon Fernandez; Dawn Rooney; Amanda Scilacci; Linda Spence; B.C.; Andrea Pearson; Julie Keenan; C.K.; Connie; Ashley Morris; Linda Lee Jones; Nancy; S.J.; Nancy Marston Gabriel; C.C.; M.A.; N.B.; Alyson Jones; Amy Young; Joyce; R.A.; V.M.; Tasha Stewart; V.L.; E.E.; Pat Becker; Linda Lee Caldwell; Natalee McRoberts; Ashlyn Clark; Janet Wimmer; Marinda Reeves; Robin; C.S.; LaTasha Anderson; Dawn Riffe; K.Z.; Tracy Nudelman; K.T.; Jennifer; E.B.; Stacey Chapman; Emily James; Sherri; S.F.; B.W.; Lori; L.N.; Michelle Haley; Elaine; Margaret; Janice; Linda; K.D.; Linda; A.W.; G.H.; S.C.; Renae Erskine; K.M.; Debra Skeens; Wendy; H.H.; M.F.; L.H.G.; Michelle Dominguez; R.R.; Pamela; Marla Peterson; Jessica; S.A.; Melody; Stephanie Worley; Steph; Tiffany Frye; Melinda; Cynthia Figueroa; Tanya L. Ewbank; Karen; Pamela Kaye Board; Stephanie

**Vermont**

Michelle Ziter; Sharon; Diane Ballou; Laurie Monahan; P.M.

**Washington**

Julie Ferguson; Cindy; Jill; Cheryl Nuesmeyer; Patricia; Deborah; Barbara Wolfe; Bonnie; Kathleen; Elizabeth; M.P.; Karen; Roxanne; Karen; April Kiessling; Tori B. Helberg; Dayle Robbs; Linda Wallace; Aquila Fisk; L.K.; Ellen Caraway; Vashti; Wendi; Connie; Patricia Krank; Veronica Maruda; Carol Schuette; Nanette Harder; Susan; B.H.; Denay Silva; Kathleen; Judy; Kelly; Kris Foster; Mary; S.E.; Catherine; Eileen Robinson; Lynnlee; Rachel Perez Castro; Lois Ellen Edwards; P.T.; Rachelle Sparrow; J.S.; K.M.; Sarah Ahumada; L.C.; Nancy Roa; Cherie Crettol; Kristi Davenport; Victoria; Brenda Connors

**Wisconsin**

Rose Mensah; Jane Frantz; Sanon Harrell; Kimberly Moss; M.T.; Dawn Truelsen; Nikki McCabe; Erin Menzel; Janet Bruyette; Lyssa King; Tammy Rouse; C.S.; Colleen Swisher; Janelle; C.C.; Virginia; Laura; Delia McCoy; Tracy; Marilyn Vandekieft; Mary; T.B.; Michelle Piotter; Robin; Lori Resch;



Linda; Annette; Theresa; Diane Rolfs; T.J.; Mary Olson; T.M.;

Paula Langhoff; Mary Kidney; Amber; Lani Harper

**West Virginia**

Donna Ferrell; Nina Elliott; Melinda Miller; Vicki Stroud;

Cristine Walker; M.S.; J.S.; Roe; P.M.; Sarah; Linda Muto;

C.N.

**Wyoming**

Lana Horton; Jennifer; Kelly Murray; Darlene Soule;

Robynn Gabel; Pam; M.J.O.

UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE NINTH CIRCUIT

Form 8. Certificate of Compliance for Briefs

Instructions for this form: <http://www.ca9.uscourts.gov/forms/form08instructions.pdf>

9th Cir. Case Number(s)

23-35440, 23-35450

I am the attorney or self-represented party.

This brief contains

6,830

words, including

0

words

manually counted in any visual images, and excluding the items exempted by FRAP 32(f). The brief's type size and typeface comply with FRAP 32(a)(5) and (6).

I certify that this brief (*select only one*):

- complies with the word limit of Cir. R. 32-1.
- is a **cross-appeal** brief and complies with the word limit of Cir. R. 28.1-1.
- is an **amicus** brief and complies with the word limit of FRAP 29(a)(5), Cir. R. 29-2(c)(2), or Cir. R. 29-2(c)(3).
- is for a **death penalty** case and complies with the word limit of Cir. R. 32-4.
- complies with the longer length limit permitted by Cir. R. 32-2(b) because (*select only one*):
- it is a joint brief submitted by separately represented parties.
- a party or parties are filing a single brief in response to multiple briefs.
- a party or parties are filing a single brief in response to a longer joint brief.
- complies with the length limit designated by court order dated .
- is accompanied by a motion to file a longer brief pursuant to Cir. R. 32-2(a).

Signature

/s/Nathan T Seltzer

Date

20 Sept 2024

(use "s/[typed name]" to sign electronically-filed documents)

Feedback or questions about this form? Email us at [forms@ca9.uscourts.gov](mailto:forms@ca9.uscourts.gov)